Preface to the First Edition


2. Like other Broadway-loving families, especially those residing on the west side of the country, it took the release of the *West Side Story* movie with Natalie Wood for us to become fully cognizant of this show.


8. Joseph Kerman, *Opera as Drama*; Paul Robinson, *Opera & Ideas*.

Notes to Pages xv–xxii

12. Ibid., 37. Quotation from Bernstein, 147. For a more detailed exploration of Swain and Banfield and the differences between opera and musicals, see my review essay of Banfield in Block, Review essay, 1996.

A New Preface

1. Several of the revivals on this list that appeared before 1995 were discussed in the first edition.
4. Ibid., 35.
7. Block, “Reading Musicals.”
8. The volumes in Yale Broadway Masters and, in the future, Oxford’s Broadway Legacies, are among recent attempts to fully engage the musical component of a musical. Six volumes of the former series were published between 2003 and 2009: Richard Rodgers (Block), Andrew Lloyd Webber (John Snelson), Jerome Kern (Stephen Banfield); Sigmund Romberg (William A. Everett), Frank Loesser (Thomas L. Riis), and John Kander and Fred Ebb (James Leve). George Gershwin (Larry Starr) is scheduled to appear in 2010. Other important recent books in the field that face the music, even when it is not the central concern, include Tim Carter’s “Oklahoma!,” Raymond Knapp’s The American Musical and the Formation of National Identity and The American Musical and the Performance of Personal Identity, Bruce D. McClung’s Lady in the Dark, and Mark Eden Horowitz’s Sondheim on Music.
10. For three thoughtful books highly critical of megamusicals see Mark N. Grant, The Rise and Fall of the Broadway Musical; Scott McMillin, The Musical as Drama; and Ethan Mordden, The Happiest Corpse. Even Barry Singer, in a book that is generally sympathetic to musicals of the past thirty years, has little positive to say about Lloyd Webber (Singer, Ever After). For positive critical assessments in the scholarly literature see John Snelson’s Andrew Lloyd Webber and Jessica Sternfeld’s The Megamusical.
11. George Gershwin (Rodney Greenberg, Howard Pollack, Wayne Schneider); Oscar Hammerstein (Amy Asch); Moss Hart (Steven Bach); Jerome Kern (Stephen Banfield); Arthur Laurents (Arthur Laurents); Frank Loesser (Robert Kimball and Steve Nelson, Thomas L. Riis); Cole Porter (William McBrien); Jerome Robbins (Deborah Jowitt, Greg Lawrence); Richard Rodgers (Geoffrey Block, William G. Hyland, Meryle Secrest); Rodgers and Hammerstein (Tim Carter, Frederick Nolan); and Kurt Weill (Foster Hirsch, Lys Symonette and Kim Kowalke, Bruce D. McClung).
13. Howard Pollack, George Gershwin; and Larry Starr, George Gershwin.
Notes to Pages xxii–4

15. Thomas L. Riis, Frank Loesser.
16. This footnote indicates the points of overlap between Knapp, Miller, and Swain and the musicals discussed in the first edition of Enchanted Evenings:

ANYTHING GOES (Knapp 2005)
PORGY AND BESS (Knapp 2005; Swain, The Broadway Musical)
The CRADLE WILL ROCK (Knapp 2005; Miller, Rebels with Applause)
PAL JOEY (Miller, Rebels with Applause)
LADY IN THE DARK (Knapp, The American Musical and the Performance of Personal Identity [Knapp 2006])
CAROLISEL (Miller, From “Assassins” to “West Side Story”; Swain, The Broadway Musical)
KISS ME, KATE (Knapp 2006; Swain, The Broadway Musical)
GUYS AND DOLLS (Knapp 2005; Swain, The Broadway Musical)
MY FAIR LADY (Knapp 2006; Miller, From “Assassins” to “West Side Story”; Swain, The Broadway Musical)
WEST SIDE STORY (Knapp 2005; Miller, From “Assassins” to “West Side Story”; Swain, The Broadway Musical)

20. Ibid.
21. For a thorough and helpful introduction to Cabaret and the work of Kander and Ebb as a whole, see Leve, John Kander and Fred Ebb.

Chapter 1: Introduction

1. Book musicals contain a narrative and are represented by three discernible types: operas, operettas, and musical comedies. Operas, which come in various styles, including rock, are for the most part sung throughout. Musical comedies normally utilize contemporary urban settings with matching vernacular dialogue and music, the latter often incorporating jazz. Operettas are generally set in exotic locations, including early Americana (e.g., New England in the 1870s in Carousel and Oklahoma Territory “just after the turn of the century”) and typically utilize appropriate regional dialects and such nineteenth-century European genres as waltzes and polkas or a non-jazz musical vernacular that somehow sounds American. The largest category of non-book musicals is the revue, which may possess a unifying theme but only rarely a clearly delineated plot. In place of a book, most revues consist of a somewhat loose collection of skits (usually topical), along with dances and songs, often composed by a plethora of writers and composers.
3. *A Trip to Chinatown* contained “Reuben and Cynthia,” “The Bowery,” and Charles K. Harris’s “After the Ball”; *Little Johnny Jones* introduced “The Yankee Doodle Boy” and “Give My Regards to Broadway.”

4. Both *Irene* and *No, No, Nanette* (670 and 321 performances, respectively, in their inaugural runs) enjoyed popular revivals in the early 1970s (*No, No, Nanette* in 1971 [861 performances] and *Irene* in 1973 [604 performances]).


6. Included among these early hits are the following: Berlin (*Watch Your Step* [1914]); Kern (*Princess Shows* [1915–1918], *Sally* [1920], and *Sunny* [1925]); Porter (numerous interpolated songs in shows by other composers between 1919 and 1924 before making a hit with *Paris* in 1928); Hammerstein (*Wildflower* [1923], *Rose-Marie* [1924], *Sunny* [1925], and *The Desert Song* [1926]); George and Ira Gershwin (*Lady, Be Good!* [1924], *Oh, Kay!* [1926], and *Funny Face* [1927]); and Rodgers and Hart (*The Garrick Gaieties, Dearest Enemy*, [1925], and *A Connecticut Yankee* [1927]); and Weill (*Die Dreigroschenoper* [1927, in Germany]). Several months before the premiere of *Show Boat*, the team of Ray Henderson (music) and B. G. DeSylva and Lew Brown (lyrics) presented their first book musical hit, *Good News*.


11. Kerman, *Opera as Drama*. While under current attack for its elitism and restricted vision of dramatic worthiness, Kerman’s study remains a central text for any exploration of the relationship between music and drama. Another excellent and less judgmental study of opera with concepts that can be applied to Broadway musicals is Robinson.


14. The literature on gender studies in music is considerable and growing exponentially. The most influential work to appear is probably Susan McClary, *Feminine Endings: Music, Gender, and Sexuality* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989).

15. The top forty also includes four musicals that premiered before *Show Boat* (*The Student Prince, Blossom Time, Sally*, and *Rose-Marie*, nos. 31, 33, 37, and 40 in the 1920–1959 list) and four that first appeared after *West Side Story* (*The Sound of Music, The Music Man, Fiorello!* and *Gypsy*, nos. 4, 6, 20, and 26 in the 1920–1959 list).


17. The figure 467 is deceptively low since *Lady in the Dark* returned to Broadway after a tour for another 310 performances. The grand total of 777 performances would place this show
Notes to Pages 13–19

as the ninth longest running musical of the 1940s and no. 20 in the 1920–1959 list. See Lys Symonette and Kim H. Kowalke, eds., Speak Low, 274.

18. In any event, *Pal Joey*’s revival (542 performances) falls only five performances and one show below the top forty, and the combined number of performances of its two runs (916) would place it just below *Bells Are Ringing* at No. 14.


20. The composers, composer-lyricists, or teams that produced two or more musicals in “The Forty Longest Running Musicals on Broadway 1920–1959” include the following: Adler and Ross (*Damn Yankees, Pajama Game*); Arlen and Harburg (*Bloomer Girl, Jamaica*); Berlin (*Annie Get Your Gun, Call Me Madam*); Rome (*Fanny, Wish You Were Here*); Styne (*Bells Are Ringing, Gentlemen Prefer Blonds, Gypsy, High Button Shoes*); and Wright and Forrest (*Kismet, Song of Norway*). Also missing is Gene de Paul’s *Li’l Abner* (with lyrics by Johnny Mercer) that debuted between the premieres of *Show Boat* and *West Side Story*. The contributions by Rudolf Friml, Ray Henderson, and Sigmund Romberg preceded *Show Boat*; Meredith Willson’s *The Music Man* followed *West Side Story* by two months.

21. Since Rodgers and Hammerstein produced *Annie Get Your Gun*, this leaves *Kiss Me, Kate* as the only show among the top five musicals of the 1940s that was not created or produced by the ubiquitous team.


24. Similar criteria motivate Gänzl’s criteria of selection: “Firstly, we chose those pieces which a theatre-goer would be likely to encounter on the current stages of … America, the hits of today and the hits of yesterday which have been brought back for the further enjoyment of the theatre-going public. Secondly, we chose those shows which had a notable success in their own times, those which have left a particular legacy of favourite songs, those which are significant historically or artistically and those which are just plain good and which deserve a reappearance on the modern stage. Thirdly, we added our own particular favourites among the shows of yesteryear which we hope, if we bring them to your notice, might become favourites of yours as well.” Gänzl and Lamb, *Gänzl’s Book of the Musical Theatre*, p. xii.

25. See Block, “The Broadway Canon.”


Chapter 2: Show Boat

5. The Secaucus materials discussed later in this chapter are identified in “Manuscript Sources for Ravenal’s Entrance and Meeting with Magnolia” in the online website.
6. Some reviewers of the album noted with admiration that the McGlinn reconstruction, which featured noted operatic crossover artists Frederica von Stade as Magnolia and Teresa Stratas as Julie, contained only ten minutes’ less music than Wagner’s Die Walküre.
8. Ibid. According to Gerald Bordman, Show Boat opened with a cast of only nineteen-six chorus members (fifty-two white and thirty-two black) and twelve black dancers. Bordman, Jerome Kern, 286.
10. Cecil Smith and Glenn Litton, Musical Comedy in America, 158.
14. Kreuger, “Some Words about ‘Show Boat,’” 17. In Ferber’s novel Cap’n Andy becomes part of his beloved river when he is thrown overboard in a storm and drowns, Julie becomes a prostitute, and Ravenal and Magnolia are never reunited.
16. Ibid., 13. Two pages later Engel asserts his view that only Porgy and Bess (1935) and The Boys from Syracuse (1938) before Pal Joey (1940) have revivable books.
17. Ibid., 14. In a book published five years later Engel reiterates his 1967 perspective, but concedes Show Boat’s originality as well as the historical importance of its interweaving five couples: “Nothing as rich as this had happened before it in any other libretto, nothing as courageous in subject matter and nothing in America as opulent musically.” Engel, Words with Music, 70.
Notes to Pages 23–26

souvenir program) are placed in italics. The website also provides an encapsulated view of the most important subsequent productions.

24. EMI/Angel CDS 7–49108–2.


26. With the issuing of McGlinn’s reconstructed recording, a libretto that is virtually complete for those scenes where underscored dialogue plays an important role (act I, scenes 1, 2, 4, 7, 8) finally became widely available. Act II, scene 3, is also nearly complete and the text of act II, scenes 4 and 9, is well represented. The only previously published libretto is based on the 1928 London production (Chappell, 1934).


28. McGlinn candidly concedes that his recording is not absolutely complete. He does not, for example, include the Entr’acte to act II or several “utility arrangements . . . which are in any case verbatim repeats of music recorded herein,” and he notes also the omission of underscoring in act II, scene 2. McGlinn leaves unmentioned the unfortunate absence of the interpolated “Good Morning, Carrie” from the same scene and Gustav Lange’s “Blumenlied” (“Flower Song”). The latter served Kern as the “Incidental Music, played on the Stage during the presentation of ‘The Parson’s Bride’” in act I, scene 6.

29. The dramatic changes are fully reflected in Chappell’s published libretto of 1934, but the published vocal score, while it contains “Dance Away the Night” and omits “Good-bye, Ma Lady Love” and “Hey, Feller,” does not include “How’d You Like to Spoon with Me?” and prints “Ol’ Man River” in the original C major (to better feature Robeson’s basso profundo; the London “Ol’ Man River” was transposed down a whole tone to B♭ from its New York key of C major).

30. After 418 performances the 1946 revival would spawn two phenomenal national tours (fourteen cities and forty-five cities, respectively) that would last the better part of the next two years.

31. Kreuger, “Show Boat,” 160–63. The legacy of the 1946 production is largely preserved in the Welk vocal score and the unpublished libretto distributed by the Rodgers and Hammerstein Theatre Library for those who would produce Show Boat over the next five decades. Missing, however, from both the Welk score and the acting edition of the 1946 libretto is Kim as an adult and her song “Nobody Else but Me.” This was the song that replaced Norma Terris’s impersonations and Edith Day’s new song for the London production, “Dance Away the Night.” Although he acknowledges that it was made “to facilitate travel and trim the running time to avoid overtime fees for the stage hands,” Kreuger asserts that these changes “strengthen the reunion of Magnolia and Ravenal.” Ibid., 170.

32. For Kreuger, the three scene cuts “were made to help trim the lengthy show to a more conventional running time,” and, since “developments in scenic technology permitted speedier set changes than were possible in the 1920s,” such “front” scenes (including act I, scene 3) were an unnecessary impediment to contemporary possibilities in stagecraft. Kreuger also defends another deletion when he writes that “although the replacement of one song for another in the same spot requires the sacrifice of ‘I Might Fall Back on You,’ the better of the two songs is retained; and the script probably benefits from far smoother action.” Ibid., 160 and 162.


34. Ibid.

35. The London production that docked on July 29 at the Adelphi Theatre stayed afloat longer than any previous production, closing 910 performances later on September 29, 1973. Its legacy is preserved on a recording promoted somewhat inaccurately in the jacket notes.
as “the first and only complete recording containing all the lyrics and music.” Stanyon Records 10048 (two LPs).
36. The first of these, “How’d You Like to Spoon with Me?” (Kern’s first London success of 1905 with lyrics by Edward Laska) served in the 1971 London production as an interpolation to replace “I Might Fall Back on You.” The second, “Dance Away the Night,” which Kern had written as a new last song for the London Magnolia, Edith Day, in 1928, was transferred to Frank Schultz.
37. “Gallivantin’ Aroun’” (sung by Irene Dunne in the film) was not used.
39. Variety critic Jeremy Gerard noted that these signs were “just about the only things that remain unchanged over the show’s 40–year span”; reprinted in New York Theatre Critics’ Reviews 55/13 (1994): 262.
41. Ibid., n.p. Robeson’s “Ah Still Suits Me” from the film was used as underscoring.
42. Kim’s “It’s Getting Hotter in the North,” dropped after opening night in 1927, was restored as a dance number; Queenie’s “Hey, Feller!” (gone since the 1928 London production) and “How’d You Like to Spoon with Me?” from London 1971 were relegated to underscoring.
44. A precedent for this technique can be found in 1916, when to accompany the silent film Glo-ria’s Romance, Kern had composed “fifteen themes for specific characters and situations.” Bordman, Jerome Kern, 128.
45. Not only do these motives avoid notes outside the scale, but they also capture the openness of the river as well as its simplicity and purity by avoiding the tensions inherent in half steps.
46. Bordman was perhaps the first to note “that the Cotton Blossom theme is essentially the beginning of the chorus of ‘Ol’ Man River’ played in reverse and accelerated.” Bordman, Jerome Kern, 290. The relationship between the “Cotton Blossom,” “Ol’ Man River,” and Cap’n Andy’s themes is also mentioned by Ethan Mordden (“ ‘Show Boat’ “).
47. Bordman writes that Kern “demonstrated the universality of some folk themes when he returned to his roots and used an old Bohemian melody for Cap’n Andy’s entrance.” Bordman, Jerome Kern, 291. Dvořák authority John Clapham notes a connection between Dvořák’s theme and the spiritual “Swing Low, Sweet Chariot.” Clapham, “The Evolution of Symphony ‘From the New World,’” Musical Quarterly 44 (April 1958): 175; see also Jean E. Snyder, “A Great and Noble School of Music: Dvořák” and “Harry T. Burleigh, and the African American Spiritual,” in Dvořák in America 1892–1895, ed. John C. Tibbetts (Portland, Ore: Amadeus Press, 1993), 123–48, especially 131–32. Three years before Show Boat Kern quoted the openings of both the first movement and the even more well-known slow movement from Dvořák’s symphony in the dance music of “Shufflin’ Sam” (from Sitting Pretty), perhaps as a musical pun to support Sam’s motto, “This old world’s no place to cry and be glum in.” Bordman attributes this last Dvořák reference to orchestrator Robert Russell Bennett. Bordman, Jerome Kern, 249.
48. It is more difficult to offer an unequivocal identification of the theme associated with Sheriff Vallon. Unlike the “Cotton Blossom,” Cap’n Andy, and Parthy themes, which establish immediate associations, Vallon’s theme, introduced immediately after the Overture, at first suggests a more generalized darker side of river life rather than a specific human representative of law and order. At its second appearance, where stage directions tell directors to
“enter Vallon,” Kern makes a direct association between Vallon and his theme, an association that Kern will recall at the conclusion of “Make Believe” (“enter Vallon followed by Joe”).

49. In the 1994 Broadway revival Cap’n Andy’s theme is absent on both these occasions.

50. Not only does Kern adopt the B section of The Beauty Prize music as the B section of “Where’s the Mate?” he also retains its unusual modulation from G major to F♯ major.

51. The three-note descending scalar fragment also returns prominently in the opening chorus (sung by whites) at the Midway Plaisance in Chicago (Harms, 181).

52. Julie’s song “Bill,” if not her fate, is also foreshadowed by the barker at the Chicago Fair (Harms, 186).

53. Also mm. 5–6, 9–10, and 15–16.

54. Stanley Green notes this reference to “Make Believe” in The Rodgers and Hammerstein Story (New York: John Day, 1963), 58–59. Ethan Mordden and Deena Rosenberg provide two additional examples of thematic reminiscence. In “Why Do I Love You?” the orchestra plays the first eight measures of “I Might Fall Back on You” while a chorus sings “Hours are not like years, / So dry your tears! / What a pair of love birds!” Immediately thereafter Ravenal reprises the first eight measures of “Can’t Help Lovin’ Dat Man” to the words “I’ll come home as early as I can, / Meanwhile be good and patient with our man.” Mordden, “ ‘Show Boat,’” 81, and Rosenberg, “ ‘Show Boat’ Sails into the Present,” New York Times, April 24, 1983, sec. 2, 12.

55. Show Boat (Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday, Page, 1926), 183–85.

56. The meeting scene portion of act 1, scene 1, is found in Harms, 37–53, Chappell, 36–52, and Welk, 31–46; the libretto appears in the McGlinn booklet of the EMI recording, 62–66.

57. This harmonic progression is known in classical theoretical parlance as a deceptive cadence (a B-minor triad in the key of D major).

58. This chord, an augmented sixth chord on B♭ expands into a dominant A-major triad to prepare circuitously the return to the tonal center of D.

59. It is similarly not an accident that Magnolia and Ravenal’s declaration of love at the conclusion of the act will also be a waltz, “You Are Love.” Considering the importance of this waltz section in “Make Believe,” its omission in both the 1936 and 1951 film versions is regrettable.

60. The Library of Congress typescript (identified in “Manuscript Sources” no. 1 of the online website) shows that before settling on “convention’s P’s and Q’s” the line read, “There really is no cause to have the blues,” a lyric that was removed before Kern’s first musical draft of this scene. In the third section of the song, this same typescript shows that “the world we see” replaced “reality.”

61. The 1951 MGM film version offers yet another division of this material before Magnolia and Ravenal profess their love together:

ravénal: Others find peace of mind in pretending
        Couldn’t you?
magnolia: Couldn’t I?
both: Couldn’t we:
ravénal: Make believe our lips are blending
       In a phantom kiss or two or three—
both: Might as well make believe I love you—
       For, to tell the truth . . . I do.
62. In addition to the Library of Congress and New York Public Library libretto typescripts there are two substantial musical drafts for this scene housed in the Library of Congress (designated Draft 1 and Draft 2 in the “Manuscript Sources” no. 1 of the online website). All of the Library of Congress material was acquired from the Warner Brothers Warehouse in Secaucus, New Jersey.

63. In the Library of Congress typescript Frank appears before Ravenal has the opportunity to pick up Ellie’s handkerchief.

64. The 1927 production offered two other exchanges between Ellie and Frank that succeeded in conveying the dynamics between them. The first of these opens act I, scene 3 (Outside a Waterfront Gambling Saloon), where Ellie explains to Frank that she “won’t never marry no actor”; the second appears in scene 5 where she informs him that she might settle for Frank if nothing better comes along (“I Might Fall Back on You”).

65. The dialogue in the New York Public Library typescript (see “Manuscript Sources” no. 2 of the online website) goes like this:

```
parthy (Off): Magnolia! (She enters lower deck.) Andy! Drat that man, he’s never home—Magnolia! (Magnolia enters on top deck. Windy motions her to stand still where she is so that Parthy won’t see her. Windy exits R. Parthy exits L.)

ravenal (Ravenal resumes soliloquy): Who cares if my boat goes upstream?

parthy (Off): Nola!

ravenal: Or if the gale bids me go with the river’s flow.
```

The Library of Congress typescript (see “Manuscript Sources” no. 2 of the online website) originally had Magnolia’s stage action occur after Ravenal sang this last line with corrections made in pencil.


67. During the tryouts Kern and Hammerstein made still more changes in this scene. Shortly before its closing moments, according to Draft 2 of the Library of Congress score, the lovers sing a reprise of the waltz (section 2) for fifteen measures, after which Kern indicated by arrows and hatch marks a direct move to the coda. Draft 2 also contained another six measures of “Make Believe” after the coda, which Kern deleted before the return of Vallon’s theme. The underscored waltz of section 2 then led to a scene between Magnolia and Joe and “Ol’ Man River.”

In the earlier musical manuscript (Draft 1) Kern had Ravenal introduce the main chorus of “Make Believe” with a different text (beginning with “As the river goes so time goes”), and while the text is crossed out, the melody provides the underscoring between Ravenal and Vallon before the former sings the first A section of “Where’s the Mate for Me?” Also in Draft 1 after Ravenal hears Magnolia’s piano theme, a chorus of Girls rather than Ravenal himself repeats the theme. Kern’s inspiration to have Magnolia’s piano theme intrude upon Ravenal’s song was apparently not part of the initial conception.

In contrast to Draft 2, a draft that clearly served as the model for the published vocal scores, Draft 1 does not show the third and fourth sections of “Make Believe,” sections that provide much psychological nuance and musical richness to the scene. Instead, Draft 1 brings back the six measures of coda and the final confrontation between Ravenal and Vallon. As in Draft 2, the scene in Draft 1 concludes with Magnolia seeing Joe, and their dialogue (not given) is underscored by the opening strains of “Ol’ Man River” and “Can’t Help Lovin’ Dat Man.”
68. Included among this group of song hits are “When I Grow Too Old to Dream” from The Night Is Young (1935) with Romberg, and a trio of hits with Kern, “The Folks Who Live on the Hill” and “Can I Forget You?” from High, Wide and Handsome (1937), and the Academy Award–winning “The Last Time I Saw Paris” from Lady, Be Good (1941). Soon after he had begun working with Richard Rodgers, Hammerstein wrote “It Might as Well Be Spring” and “It’s a Grand Night for Singing” for State Fair (1945) with Rodgers and “All through the Day” from Centennial Summer (1946) with Kern.

69. Beginning with the first of three versions of Show Boat in 1929, Hollywood would adapt twenty-six of Hammerstein’s Broadway shows for film.

70. Kern turned down Hammerstein’s offer in 1942 to write a musical based on Lynn Riggs’s play, Green Grow the Lilacs (1931). One year later the property was turned over to Rodgers. The result, of course, was Oklahoma!

71. The Annie Oakley property turned out to be Berlin’s greatest book show, Annie Get Your Gun, in 1946 with a book by Herbert and Dorothy Fields.

72. The quotation is from Bordman, Jerome Kern, 294. The sensitive issues explored in Show Boat have hardly gone away. In reviewing the 1993 Toronto production of Show Boat, directed by Prince, theater critic John Lahr found it necessary to respond to the Coalition to Stop Show Boat, a group that tried to close the show for its alleged “racist, anti-African propaganda.” According to Lahr “the past must be remembered for its sins as well as for its triumphs” and Show Boat admirably “chronicles slavery not to condone but to deplore it.” “Mississippi Mud,” New Yorker, October 25, 1993, 123–26; quotation on p. 126.

73. Ibid., 126.

Chapter 3: Anything Goes

1. Porter’s original lyric, “I wouldn’t care for those nights in the air / That the fair Mrs. Lindbergh went through,” intended for the unproduced Star Dust (1931), was replaced in Anything Goes by the now familiar “Flying too high with some guy in the sky / Is my idea of nothing to do, / Yet I get a kick out of you.” See Eells, The Life That Late He Led, 113, and Robert Kimball, ed., The Complete Lyrics of Cole Porter, 167 and 270.

2. Eells, The Life That Late He Led, 111; Miles Kreuger, “Some Words About ‘Anything Goes,’” 13; and Lee Davis, Bolton and Wodehouse and Kern, 329–36. Kreuger also points out that the Bolton-Wodehouse book was not really about a shipwreck. In fact, a fake bomb created a mood of terror that was eventually alleviated by a celebratory prayer, “Blow, Gabriel, Blow.” Davis’s more detailed survey of the early genesis of Anything Goes has the advantage of being based on a previously unknown first draft from 1934 in addition to Bolton’s less reliable reconstruction of the still-missing second draft (the rejected draft) years later. Davis does not seem to be aware of the Bolton scenario now in the State Historical Society of Wisconsin, but Ethan Mordden discusses it briefly in Sing for Your Supper, 69–70. Thanks to James Hepokoski for calling my attention to the existence of the Bolton scenario.


7. In the McGlinn recording “There’s No Cure for Travel” is relegated to the appendix.

8. The McGlinn notes indicate that Merman’s principal objection was the line “She made the maid who made the room,” with its implied homosexuality. Ibid., 33. A similar line appears in act I, scene 2, when Billy asks if Reno made the boat and a character named Snooks replies: “Did she make the Boat? She made the Cap’n!” Perhaps because of its heterosexual implications this line was permissible and could be retained in the dialogue (see the 1934 libretto, 1–2–13).

9. In this instance McGlinn was reluctant to perform an appendectomy so he inserted “What a Joy to Be Young” in the main body of his recording rather than its rightful place in his appendix beside “There’s No Cure Like Travel,” “Kate the Great,” and “Waltz Down the Aisle.”


11. Ibid., 17.


13. Perhaps because present-day late-arriving listeners usually come into the theater already whistling “I Get a Kick Out of You,” McGlinn took the initiative of placing “Buddie, Beware” in the body of his recording rather than the appendix.

14. Weidman has also written three librettos for Sondheim musicals, Pacific Overtures (1976), Assassins (1990), and Road Show (2008).


19. Ibid., 35.


25. Ibid., 133–37. Despite Kreuger’s best efforts, he was unable to discover the full meaning of the reference, “Drumstick Lipstick,” and concluded that its meaning “is lost to the ages.” In the new millennium, readers of Slate Magazine’s Timothy Noah replied to his plea and located two 1934 references to Drumstick lipstick in New York Times ads for Drumstick face power and the Drumstick compact, various cosmetic products manufactured by the French firm, Charbert. Noah announced the solution in “Drumstick Lipstick, Explained!” posted June 16, 2005.


27. A more direct reference to Aimee Semple McPherson had occurred in Moss Hart’s sketch on the headline “Gandhi Goes on Hunger Strike” in the 1933 revue As Thousands Cheer (music by Berlin).

29. Ibid., 14.
31. 1934 libretto, 2–1–11.
32. Those concerned by this usurpation of Hope’s role and her solo opportunity may be somewhat placated to learn that in 1987 she is given a new interpolation, “Goodbye, Little Dream, Goodbye” (act II, scene 1), and a duet with Billy and some sailors, “All through the Night” (a song from the original 1934 version now transferred to act II, scene 2). Furthermore, she is allowed to retain her interpolated duet with Billy in act I, scene 7, “It’s De-Lovely,” which had been introduced in act I, scene 2, of the 1962 version (see the online website).
33. 1934 libretto, 1–6–71. Mrs. Wentworth is the owner of the Pomeranian canine that Billy turns into a Mexican hairless.
34. In 1962 Billy is Chinchilian. The phrase “putting on the dog” made a comeback. Throughout the gestation of this first edition of *Enchanted Evenings* the New Yorker regularly displayed ads for “Put on the Dog” T-shirts, the expected side of the shirt featuring drawings of the front or back of a dog.
38. “Everything’s Coming Up Roses” (lyrics, Stephen Sondheim; music, Jule Styne) from *Gypsy* (1959), also written for Merman as the eccentric Rose, uses a variation of this idea on the title words.
39. In an early version of “Blow, Gabriel Blow,” vastly different melodically but otherwise rhythmically identical to the familiar version, the triplets are absent. See the Cole Porter Collection, Box 15, Folder 121, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut.
40. “Easy to Love,” Billy’s love song to Hope, dropped because of its difficulty for William Gaxton, also retains Reno’s half-note triplet in the midst of a chromatic line.
41. Porter harmonizes “if today” with a dominant seventh on C (C–E–G–B♭), a chord that leads to a change of key (F major) two measures later.
43. Those responsible for choosing the interpolated songs either inadvertently or by design discovered two that fit in with the syncopated world of Reno and Billy, “Friendship” and “It’s De-Lovely,” both of which share melodic fragments in common with the original “Anything Goes” and, of course, many other Porter songs.

Chapter 4: Porgy and Bess

Notes to Pages 58–64

Tibbett singing the title role in blackface, was performed only ten times in 1933 and 1934. African Americans were similarly excluded in most of the other important roles.


4. Only one year after its Met debut the international reputation of *Porgy and Bess* as an opera was further enhanced in Glyndebourne. A third uncut recording generated by this production was made in 1989. See the Discography and Filmography in the online website.

5. After Gershwin’s *Pardon My English*, Freedley (without Aarons) would produce four hits for Porter shows: *Anything Goes* (1934), *Red, Hot and Blue!* (1936), *Leave It to Me!* (1938), and *Let’s Face It* (1941).


9. The outline of scenes and songs in the online website indicates the division of lyrical labor between DuBose Heyward and Ira Gershwin.

10. Gershwin began his orchestration with act I, scene 2, completing it in February 1935. In a letter to Schillinger (May 16) the composer wrote that he had completed act I, scene 1. Act II occupied Gershwin’s attentions at least for the remainder of May and June, and on July 19 Gershwin conducted a run-through of acts I and II at the CBS studio. Completion dates for act III are even more meticulously documented: scene 1 (July 22); scene 2 (August 4), scene 3 (August 23). Several weeks later Gershwin wrote on the first page of the orchestral score, “finished September 2, 1935.”


15. Ibid.


17. Ibid. Several days later the *New York Times* gave the composer an opportunity to respond at some length to his critics: “I chose the form I have used for ‘Porgy and Bess’ because I believe that music lives only when it is in serious form. When I wrote the ‘Rhapsody in Blue’ I took ‘Blues’ and put them in a large and more serious form. That was twelve years ago and the ‘Rhapsody in Blue’ is still very much alive, whereas if I had taken the same themes and put them in songs they would have been gone years ago.” G. Gershwin, 1.


23. Ibid.

25. George Gershwin, “Rhapsody in Catfish Row,” 1–2. Interestingly, neither Atkinson nor Downes was bothered by Gershwin’s songs. In fact, according to Atkinson it was their presence that made the “hour of formal music transitions” palatable. Similarly, Downes may have felt that there were a few songs too many “which hold back the dramatic development,” but he undeniably shared Atkinson’s view that “it is in the lyrical moments [i.e., songs] that Mr. Gershwin is most completely felicitous.” Gershwin finds an ardent recent defender in Lawrence Starr, who observes that “for a nineteenth-century European like Verdi, it is acceptable—perhaps even appropriate and admirable—to have ‘hit tunes’ in an opera; for a twentieth-century American it is inappropriate and vulgar.” Starr, “Gershwin’s ‘Bess,’” 430.
29. The following discussion of the “Buzzard Song” is adapted (with some changes) from Block, “Gershwin’s Buzzard.”
30. The play by Dorothy and DuBose Heyward was originally published by Doubleday in 1927. Page references in this chapter correspond to the version of Porgy anthologized in Famous American Plays of the 1920s (New York: Dell, 1959), 207–307. The typescript of DuBose Heyward’s libretto with George Gershwin’s annotations is now housed in the Music Division of the Library of Congress, Washington, D.C. (Gershwin Collection, Box 27, Item 2).
31. Dorothy and DuBose Heyward, Porgy, 252.
32. Typescript libretto, 2–18.
33. Ibid.
34. Ibid., 2–14.
35. Armitage, George Gershwin, 52.
36. Isaac Goldberg, George Gershwin, 325.
37. Ewen, George Gershwin, 231.
39. The original 78 R.P.M. discs (Victor 11878/81) were reissued on long-playing records (RCA Camden CAL 500) and again on CDs (Pearl Gemm CDS 9483). At the same October 14 session, which took place only four days after the Broadway premiere, Tibbett also recorded “It Ain’t Necessarily So” and, with Helen Jepson, “Bess, You Is My Woman Now.” The selections sung by Tibbett and Jepson have also been reissued on Pearl Gemm CDS 9483. The baritone was the Met’s most highly marketable commodity where new operas were concerned, and he had already portrayed a black man there (the title role of Louis Gruenberg’s Emperor Jones in 1933). It was not until the administration of Rudolf Bing that black singers were welcomed at the Met (Marian Anderson, the first, followed closely by Robert McFerrin, were both in 1955).
40. A facsimile of the Los Angeles Gershwin program appears in Merle Armitage, George Gershwin: Man and Legend (New York: Duell, Sloan & Pearce, 1958), between pages 144 and 145. The Duncan recordings were issued on Decca DL-9024.
42. Armitage, George Gershwin: Man and Legend, 156–60.
46. Wayne Shirley, “Reconciliation on Catfish Row.”
47. Shirley, “‘Porgy and Bess,’” 104.
50. The video directed by Nunn was a Primetime/BBC and Homevale/Greg Smith Production, a Picture Music International Release, and was issued on EMI Records, Ltd., 1993.
51. Allen Woll explores the “irony” of *Porgy and Bess* as a black musical created by whites for a white audience, and David Horn shows how Gershwin’s opera continues to pose “struggles over meaning” between various social and ethnic groups. See Woll, *Black Musical Theatre*, 154–75, and David Horn, “From Catfish Row to Granby Street.”
52. Horn, “From Catfish Row to Granby Street.” Horn explores the ideological conflict in 1989 between the Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Society, who praised Gershwin for “forging a new musical language,” and the Liverpool Anti-Racist and Community Arts Association, who condemned Gershwin for “wading into black culture.”
53. Miles Kreuger, “*Showboat,*” 212.
54. Ira Gershwin writes that in preparation for the 1951 recording of the complete opera he went through the score and changed “some opprobrious terms in the recitatives—there were about twenty—to substitutes inoffensive to the ear of today.” Ira Gershwin, *Lyrics on Several Occasions*, 83.
56. Hall Johnson, “Porgy and Bess.”
57. Ibid., 24. Johnson made the following comment about Gershwin’s recitatives: “We are confronted with a series of musical episodes which, even if they do not belong together, could be made to appear as if they do by a better handling of the musical connecting tissue.”
58. Ibid., 25. Johnson also finds fault with Mamoulian’s staging for its misperceptions about African Americans.
59. Ibid., 26. According to Johnson, it is incredulous that Sporting Life “could be so entirely liberated from that superstitious awe of Divinity which even the most depraved southern Negro never quite loses.”
60. Ibid.
62. Ibid.
64. Ibid., 103.
65. Ibid., 102.
68. One important difference might be noted. In *Porgy and Bess* all six prayers are in the same key; in the African-American Pentecostal tradition each singer chooses his or her own key.
70. Henry Louis Gates Jr., “‘Authenticity,’ or the Lesson of Little Tree.” “The Blindfold Test,” which forced unknowing listeners to make their listening judgments independently of
Notes to Pages 72–80

racial or gender bias, was invented by the influential English jazz critic, Leonard Feather, for *Metronome* in 1946. In his tribute to Feather, Gary Giddins assessed the test’s importance: “The significance of the blindfold test exceeds its entertainment value. It added a phrase to the language and a dimension to the issue of critical authority, demonstrating that people often judge a work of art differently when they don’t know who signed it.”


73. Starr, “Toward a Reevaluation,” 27.

74. Additional connections between Porgy’s theme and other characters are charted in Deena Rosenberg, *Fascinating Rhythm*, 277, 279, 282, 285, and 294.

75. Gershwin enhances the blues flavor by supporting Porgy’s melodic minor third (G♮) with a major harmony (G♯).

76. Again, Gershwin creates a harmonic clash with a G♯ against the G♮ in the melody. Note also the resemblance between this Porgy theme and Gershwin’s Prelude No. 2 for piano composed in 1926.

77. The melodic as well as rhythmic profile of Porgy’s “loneliness” theme also figures prominently in the River Family of themes in *Show Boat* shown in Example 2.2. It may not be too fanciful to speculate that Gershwin’s choice for Porgy’s motive, like Kern’s choice for his River Family of motives, may owe something to Dvořák’s “New World” Symphony and the African-American spiritual “Swing Low, Sweet Chariot” (see chapter 2, note 47).

78. Starr, “Toward a Reevaluation,” 36; see also Starr’s extended analysis of a Gershwin song in “Gershwin’s ‘Bess.’”

79. Examples include the following: “Oh, I Can’t sit Down!” (the word “down!” at the outset, and in the middle section, “Hap-py feel-in,’’ “a-steal-in,’’ “con-ceal-in,’’ and many more); “It Take a Long Pull to Get There” (the frequently repeated “get there” and “Lan’’ [the latter divided into two musical syllables]); and “I Got Plenty o’ Nuttin’” (the repeated “nut-tin’” and “pley-ty”).

80. Labeled by Gershwin in the typescript libretto 1–11. The presence of a separate “happy dust” theme was first noted by Shirley, “ ‘Porgy and Bess,’ ” 106.

81. For two recent sources, which in the absence of Gershwin’s handwritten emendations reasonably argue against the presence of a “Bess” theme, see Rosenberg, *Fascinating Rhythm*, 285, and Joseph P. Swain, *The Broadway Musical*, 62.


83. Since Bess is Porgy’s woman now, it makes some sense for him to appropriate her theme as well.

84. Vocal score, 533–36 and 559. The signature melodies for Porgy, Sporting Life (and his “happy dust”), Crown, and Bess do not exhaust the themes of the opera nor even those of act I, scene 2. Gershwin himself designated at least one other theme, the first fisherman theme used prominently in this and other scenes (see the beginning of act II, scene 1 [Vocal score, 189]). A second theme also introduced in act I is associated more specifically with the enterprising Jake; four measures before rehearsal no. 171 (Vocal score, 323) shows this theme as it opens act II, scene 3, shortly before Jake goes out into the storm that will take his life and that of his wife Clara. Finally, Gershwin assigns an orchestral motive to indicate the presence of the lawyer Frazier, who appears only in act II, scene 1,
a descriptive theme with a prominent dissonant syncopated leap of a major seventh (see rehearsal no. 41 [Vocal score, 214]).

85. Note that Peter’s melody which follows Bess’s recitative is rhythmically identical to “I Got Plenty o’ Nuttin’” (Vocal score, 329–30).

86. To complete the cycle of reminiscence motives that began this scene Gershwin returns one last time to Jake’s motive (Vocal score, 357–58) before new storm music takes over to conclude the scene (359–64). The short-long rhythm of the dirge that opens act III, scene 1 (“Clara, Clara”), might also be interpreted as an augmentation of Porgy’s loneliness theme.


Chapter 5: On Your Toes and Pal Joey


3. Ibid., 71.

4. Ibid., 91. Stanley Green summarizes other innovations in *Peggy-Ann*: “No songs were sung within the first fifteen minutes, the scenery and costumes were changed in full view of the audience, and the first and last scenes were played in almost total darkness.” Stanley Green, *Broadway Musicals Show by Show*.


6. Ibid., 118.

7. Pandro Berman, the man who dismissed the vaudeville-Russian ballet idea, produced in *Shall We Dance* (1937) a movie musical starring Astaire and Rogers (with a score and lyrics by the Gershwins) that bears more than a passing resemblance to Rodgers and Hart’s rejected conception.


13. Ibid., I-4–30.


15. 1936 libretto, I-5–34.

16. Ibid., II-2–13. In the 1983 libretto (30), Junior explains further: “I admit that basic off-beat appears in many cultures—but I would think that all would have to agree that American jazz has a very individual sound”; also, in the 1983 version Sergei expresses artistic as well as commercial motives for staging “Slaughter” when he acknowledges to Peggy that he finds the work “admirable.” His primary question is “can we dance it?” The problem facing the Russian ballet in 1983 is not that jazz is demeaning but whether a classical ballet company can master the stylistic nuances and comparable challenges of an alien form.

22. Dudar, “George Abbott Dusts Off a Broadway Classic.”
24. Ibid., I–6–39.
28. The professor reveals the limitations of his own education and refinement, since it is he who mispronounces Schubert’s name. Professor Dolan also assigns the words “Dein ist mein Herz” to the wrong song (“Ständchen”). The correct answer is “Ungeduld” from Schubert’s Die schöne Müllerin. It should also be noted that as late as 1983 the possibility that Schubert was gay was more of a conjecture than a scholarly argument. Thus Frankie in both 1936 and 1983 is most likely referring to Junior, not one of Schubert’s male lovers. See Maynard Solomon, “Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini,” 19th Century Music 12 (Spring 1989), 193–206.
29. The opening of “Goodnight Sweetheart” by Ray Noble, Jimmy Campbell, and Reg Connolly, published in 1931, also bears an unmistakable resemblance to the opening of Les Préludes.
31. On Your Toes, 1936 libretto, I–3–16 and 17. In 1983 the conclusion to the exchange that precedes “It’s Got to Be Love” is as follows (7–8):

   JUNIOR: I’ll tell you something—and I shouldn’t say it—it’s terribly personal—
   I’m very fond of you.
   FRANKIE: You are? Even with my derivative song?
   JUNIOR: Yes, Miss Frayne.
   FRANKIE: Well, in that case, why don’t you call me Frankie?
   JUNIOR: All right—and you can call me Junior.
   FRANKIE: All right. Yesterday some of the kids were dancing to my song and
   they thought it was pretty good.
   JUNIOR: Well, gee Christmas, I’d like to hear it again.
   FRANKIE: (Goes to bench. Gets music): O.K. That’s a fair exchange.

32. Rodgers’s sinking melody also conveys a new harmonic interpretation of an identical (albeit more extended) descending melody from the verse of the song (mm. 9–13) on the words, “color, Aquamarine or em’rald green. And…”
33. John Mauceri, Notes to On Your Toes.
34. By the time the audience witnesses the entire “Slaughter,” one of its principal tunes has been heard on several previous occasions, always in an appropriate context, e.g., in act I, scene 3, when Junior’s private rehearsal is interrupted by Frankie.
35. 1983 libretto, 19.
Notes to Pages 101–104

39. Stanley Green, in his *Rodgers and Hammerstein Fact Book* (217), provides more comprehensive information on *Pal Joey*’s unusual initial New York run in three theaters: Ethel Barrymore Theatre (December 25, 1940—August 16, 1941), Shubert Theatre (September 1—October 18, 1941), and St. James Theatre (October 21—November 29, 1941). Tryouts were held at the Forrest Theatre, Philadelphia, December 16–22, 1940.
47. Ibid. Engel places another four Rodgers musicals with Hammerstein among his top fifteen (*Oklahoma!, Carousel, South Pacific, and The King and I*).
48. “Plant You Now, Dig You Later,” another duet between Gladys and Lowell in 1940—rendered by Harold Lang (Joey) on the pre-revival recording—is sung solely by Gladys in 1952 (Gladys’s verse is not, however, included in the 1952 published libretto). Consequently, the comically sinister blackmailer Lowell becomes as ineffectual musically as he is dramatically (for example, his confrontation with Vera and her powerful police allies). One final change deprived Gladys of a fifth musical number (one less than Joey’s six songs) when she is excluded from “You Mustn’t Kick It Around.” But unlike Lowell, Gladys as played by Helen Gallagher in 1952 remains as she was when played in 1940 by June Havoc (sister of the famous stripper Gypsy Rose Lee), i.e., third in musical prominence after Joey and Vera and the lead show singer both in Mike Spears’s second-class nightclub in act I (“That Terrific Rainbow”) and the chic Chez Joey in act II (“The Flower Garden of My Heart”). In this last named song the character Louis (the tenor), who sings the verse, first chorus, and recitations, was added in 1952.
49. For example, in O’Hara’s Broadway typescript Joey does not sing the opening song, “Chicago,” the first song of 1952. Similarly, Joey’s audition number is nowhere to be found in the earlier script, only the words, “Joey has just finished singing.” When it appears later in the show, slightly altered as “Morocco,” it is sung by Michael Moore. See Hart and Kimball, *The Complete Lyrics of Lorenz Hart*, 271. I am grateful to Chicago’s Goodman Theatre for allowing me to see the unpublished typescripts of O’Hara’s 1940s Broadway libretto and the preliminary script.
50. Gone from “Take Him” (act II, scene 4) in 1952 are both Linda’s and Vera’s verses. Vera’s verses appear in the O’Hara Broadway typescript. See also Hart and Kimball, *The Complete Lyrics of Lorenz Hart*, 275.
Notes to Pages 104–107

Revisions in the 1952 book are more modest than those for the lyrics, although the absence of a reprise of “I Could Write a Book” from O’Hara’s 1940 Broadway transcript must be considered a significant change. The dialogue that separates the refrains in “You Mustn’t Kick It Around” was not present in 1940, and the transition lines to “Plant You Now” and “Do It the Hard Way” would later exclude Lowell. Perhaps the most substantial change in the 1952 book is the deletion of a page of dialogue between Joey and the manager of the apartment house, who dispassionately informs the anti-hero that he has until 6:00 P.M. to leave the building. Other changes in the 1952 book: Vera is now “over twenty-one” instead of “thirty-six,” Gladys’s interpretation of Lowell’s brand of humor is an old lady hit by a trolley car (rather than a truck), and Joey no longer gets a good meal at the home of Linda’s sister.


52. In O’Hara’s early typescript Joey meets Linda English, generically named Girl, at Mike Spears’s club where she performs as a singer. Like other performers at the club, Linda is initially repelled by Joey and what he stands for. In the final 1940 libretto, where Joey wins her over in front of the pet store with his fictitious story of his childhood dog Skippy, Linda acquired more sweetness. She also acquired more dialogue as a guest rather than a performer in Mike Spear’s joint in act I, scene 3, and in a telephone exchange in scene 4.

Some additional distinctions: In O’Hara’s original draft Lowell and Gladys actively solicit Linda’s help in their plan to blackmail Vera, which in the later libretto Linda merely overhears. In both versions the generous Linda warns her rival. Nevertheless, the earlier and tougher Vera thwarts the blackmail attempt without the help of Police Deputy Commissioner O’Brien when she reproduces a photograph that shows her husband and Gladys in flagrante delicto. Not present in the earlier typescript are the angry final words between Joey and Vera following Vera’s lie (that Joey frightened away the blackmailers), an exchange that credibly prepares Vera’s reprise of “Bewitched.”

In the preliminary typescript Vera was nine years older (Joey found Vera’s name in the 1910 rather than the 1919 social register; see note 50). Lowell’s racket is more clearly explained, and Lowell participates in the song “Plant You Now, Dig You Later.” The typescript also contains some additional dialogue for Joey, Mike, and Melba to create a smoother transition for “Zip.” Following “Zip,” Melba takes a costume away from a show girl and poses for photographs with Joey and another chorus girl for her newspaper. This scene is based on Joey’s thirteenth letter to his successful bandleader friend Ted, “A Bit of a Shock.” Finally, the preliminary typescript contained several pages of dialogue in which Joey is fitted for additional clothes and purchases an automobile before Linda arrives to warn Vera about the blackmail attempt.


54. Rodgers biographer Frederick Nolan writes that “Larry Hart chortled with delight when he read those lines ['I love it / Because the laugh’s on me'] over the phone to Joshua Logan and explained with glee that they meant Joey was actually on Vera Simpson.” Frederick Nolan, The Sound of Their Music: The Story of Rodgers and Hammerstein (New York: Walker, 1978), 112–13 [2002 ed., 139]. When the song was broadcast, these lyrics were changed to “the laugh’s about me.”

55. Rodgers, Musical Stages, 45. Although Goetschius does not discuss this particular point, his Exercises in Melody-Writing (first published in 1900) offers a systematic approach to a subject of great interest to Rodgers. Percy Goetschius, Exercises in Melody-Writing (New York: G. Schirmer, 1928).

Chapter 6: The Cradle Will Rock

8. Gordon, *Mark the Music*, 141–46. Blitzstein’s account of the premiere was recorded on *Marc Blitzstein Discusses His Theater Compositions*, published as “Out of the Cradle,” and reprinted posthumously in the *New York Times*. For other eye-witness accounts of the events surrounding the first performance, see Archibald MacLeish, Introduction to *The Cradle Will...*

9. John Houseman notes the irony of Blitzstein’s troubles with Musicians’ Local #802, which demanded that an orchestra be paid to remain silent during Cradle’s run at the Windsor, a commercial Broadway theater. As Houseman explains, “For thirteen weeks, eight times a week, twelve union musicians with their instruments and a contractor-conductor with his baton arrived at the theater half an hour before curtain time, signed in and descended to the basement where they remained, engrossed in card games and the reading of newspapers, while their composer colleague exhausted himself at the piano upstairs.” Run-Through, 336.


17. In citing the German premiere in Recklinghausen (1984), the first Cradle performance in continental Europe, Gordon notes that Gershon Kinsley, the director and pianist of the 1964 production and recording, “rescored it for chamber ensemble, including synthesizer.” Gordon, Mark the Music, 539.


19. Ibid.


21. Ibid.


25. Its published text and original conception called for the ten scenes to form an unbroken chain. Despite this, it became traditional to divide the work into two acts with a break after scene 6, a division observed in the Tams-Witmark Music Library rental score.


27. The quotation is taken from Brecht’s essay “On the Use of Music in an Epic Theatre.” See Bertolt Brecht, in Brecht on Theatre, John Willett, ed. and trans., 85.

28. Brecht explores these ideas in “The Modern Theatre Is the Epic Theatre (Notes to the Opera Aufstieg und Fall der Stadt Mahagonny).” See Brecht, in Brecht on Theatre, John Willett, ed. and trans., 33–42.
29. The “Croon–Spoon” portion of Scene Four is found in The Cradle Will Rock (New York: Random House, 1938), 52–58 (the piano-vocal score for this song is included) and Kozlenko, The Best Short Plays, 132–33.

30. The word “nerts,” another expression for “nuts” (as in “crazy”) was, like spoon, also used in the early 1900s. The New Dictionary of American Slang, ed. Robert L. Chapman (New York: Harper & Row, 1975), 298.

31. In the event that devotees of Bing Crosby (1901–1977), perhaps the best-remembered and best-loved crooner, are reading this note, it should be mentioned that Crosby (and many other crooners) did not share Junior’s poor sense of pitch. Blitzstein might be indicting the content of Crosby’s songs and the legion of Crosby epigones, but not crooners in general or Crosby in particular. In fact, Gordon notes that Blitzstein had considered Crosby for the film Night Shift (1942) and that several years later he gladly worked with the crooner on the American Broadcasting Station in Europe. Gordon, Mark the Music, 216, 250, 274.

32. At the risk of further complicating this analysis, it should be noted that the F center of Mister Mister’s melody in the A sections (harmonized by a D-minor seventh) is neither major nor minor but in the Lydian mode (F major with a raised fourth degree of the scale or B♭ instead of B♭).

33. The harmony here begins by alternating between E major (the key in which Daily began his second B section) and D minor. After the considerable harmonic maneuvering described in the text, this section ends up with a strong cadence back to D minor and circles back to the vamp that introduced Mr. Mister’s first a section.

34. Hitchcock, Music in the United States, 226–27. The rocking “Hawaiian guitar” accompaniment also serves as a relaxed and understated version of the accompaniment heard earlier in “Let’s Do Something.”


36. Max Unger, Notes to Beethoven’s Overture to Goethe’s “Egmont” (New York: Eulenburg, 1936), ii (with a musical illustration for this measure). It is tempting to speculate that Blitzstein had Thayer’s interpretation (reiterated in Unger’s notes) fresh on his mind. In any event the popular Eulenburg edition appeared the same year that Blitzstein wrote his Cradle.


38. In his survey of Blitzstein’s theatrical work through 1941, Robert Dietz notes three recurring ideas in the midst of Cradle’s otherwise autonomous ten scenes: the multiple appearance of the Moll’s music (scenes 1, 2, 7, and 10); the reprise of the title song, first sung in scene 7, to conclude the work three scenes later; and an ominous three-chord motive in the orchestra. This last motive first appears in scene 5 to underscore Bugs’s explanation to Harry Druggist how an explosion will kill Gus and Sadie, and reappears in scene 9 when Mr. Mister explains to Dr. Specialist that Joe Hammer’s “accident” was due to drunkenness. Dietz, “The Operatic Style of Marc Blitzstein,” 297–98.

39. Only the Moll, however, will sing the musical line first given to dreams in scene 7 (and repeated with new words to conclude the next two stanzas): “Oh, you can dream and scheme / and happily put and take, take and put…. / But first be sure / The nickel’s under your foot.”

40. Quotation in Daniel Kingman, American Music, 458. For other examples of negative criticism based at least in part on Blitzstein’s political agenda see Samuel Lipman, Arguing for Music—Arguing for Culture (Boston: David R. Godine, 1990), 157–63, and Terry Teachout, “Cradle of Lies.”
Notes to Pages 129–134

41. In his memorial tribute Copland wrote that “the taxi driver, the panhandler, the corner druggist were given voice for the first time in the context of serious musical drama…. No small accomplishment, for without it no truly indigenous opera is conceivable.” Copland, “In Memory of Marc Blitzstein (1905–1964),” Perspectives of New Music 2/2 (Spring–Summer 1964): 6.

42. Perhaps alone among recent assessments is Hitchcock’s, that “it was not so much the message as the music that was significant in Blitzstein’s art.” Hitchcock, Music in the United States, 227.

Chapter 7: Lady in the Dark and One Touch of Venus

1. To cite two examples out of many, Gerald Mast, in his otherwise comprehensive Can’t Help Singin’ (1987), offers neither an explanation nor an apology for his conspicuous neglect of Weill, while Joseph P. Swain in The Broadway Musical (1990), a more selective study of sixteen musicals, remains similarly silent about Weill’s American works. In the years after the first edition of Enchanted Evenings, Raymond Knapp made Lady in the Dark one of his thirty-eight focus musicals in the second volume of his two-volume study (Knapp, The American Musical and the Performance of Personal Identity, 266–73). Ethan Mordden treats Weill appreciatively and at relative length in Beautiful Mornin,’ devoting attention to Lady in the Dark, 59–69; One Touch of Venus, 159–62; The Firebrand of Florence, 144–48; Street Scene 148–50; Love Life, 223–228; and Lost in the Stars, 229–35. Mordden considers Weill the most versatile of Broadway practitioners, “the absolute forties composer, running through all the available genres except revue” and even makes the refreshing argument on “the superiority of Weill’s Broadway over his German output” (Mordden, 163).


3. David Drew, “Weill, Kurt (Julian).” The ensuing quotations from this article are found on pp. 305 and 307–8; for a more recent assessment by Drew see Kurt Weill: A Handbook, 45–47.


7. Letter from Weill to Ira Gershwin, February 27, 1944, Music Division, Library of Congress.

8. Kurt Weill, Notes for the original cast recording of Street Scene (Columbia OL 4139).

9. Ibid. See also Larry Stempel, “Street Scene,” 321–41.

10. Weill, Notes for the original cast recording of Street Scene.

11. Ibid.

12. Letter from Weill to Ira Gershwin, April 13, 1944, Music Division, Library of Congress. Gerald Mast also perceives second-act weaknesses in Rodgers and Hammerstein musicals. See Mast, Can’t Help Singin,’ 204–05.


15. See Arlene Croce, The Fred Astaire & Ginger Rogers Book, 142, 144, and 146 on Ginger Rogers’s film roles as women who cannot make up their minds (including the 1944 Paramount
film version of Lady in the Dark). The idea of a future Mr. Right being able to complete a “dream” song is at least as old as Victor Herbert’s “Ah, Sweet Mystery of Life” from Naughty Marietta (1910).


17. Cheryl Crawford credits stage designer Aline Bernstein, who remains un-indexed in the standard biographies of Weill; Ronald Sanders (who used Crawford as his major source for the genesis of One Touch of Venus) attributes this suggestion to Lady in the Dark costume designer Irene Sharaff. Both Crawford and Sanders offer a date, the former in June 1942 and the latter November 1941. David Drew writes that “in February 1942 The Tinted Venus headed a list of fifteen possibilities he [Weill] was considering for Cheryl Crawford.” Cheryl Crawford, One Naked Individual, 116; Sanders, The Days Grow Short, 322; and Drew, Kurt Weill: A Handbook, 328. See also Dorothy Herrmann, S. J. Perelman: A Life (New York: G. P. Putnam’s Sons, 1986), 147.


19. Crawford, One Naked Individual, 121.

20. The role of Venus, originally intended for Marlene Dietrich, was Mary Martin’s first starring Broadway role. After answering more than tentatively in the affirmative, Dietrich backed down from playing the sexy Venus, allegedly for the sake of her impressionable nineteen-year-old daughter. Martin, now mainly known from later roles as the wholesome Nellie Forbush (South Pacific) and Maria Rainer (The Sound of Music), earlier in her career had proven her sexual allure in Porter’s “My Heart Belongs to Daddy” in Leave It to Me (1938).

21. Crawford and Kazan had also worked together on Weill’s Johnny Johnson as producer and actor, respectively. Crawford continued to produce musicals, most notably Lerner and Weill’s Love Life and Lerner and Loewe’s Brigadoon (also with de Mille) and Paint Your Wagon; Kazan left musicals for theater and films after directing Venus and Love Life. According to Gerald Bordman, Kazan “was the most important American director of the late 1940s and the 1950s.” Gerald Bordman, The Oxford Companion to American Theatre, 2nd ed., 394.

22. Virgil Thomson, “Plays with Music,” New York Herald Tribune, February 23, 1941. Barlow writes the following about Lady in the Dark: “In this long score, there are not three minutes of the true Weill. And in this new medium, this new life, this new success, the promise has been buried under a branch of expensive but imitation laurel.” Samuel L. M. Barlow, “In the Theatre,” Modern Music 8/3 (March–April 1941): 189–93.

23. The Lady in the Dark playbill also included other highly distinguished collaborators: Sam H. Harris, who had earlier produced fifteen Cohan musicals, seven Berlin shows, the Gershwins’ Of Thee I Sing, Porter’s Jubilee, and Rodgers and Hart’s I’d Rather Be Right; Hassard Short, director of production, lighting, and musical sequences, who had designed illustrious shows for two decades, including The Band Wagon, Roberta, and Jubilee; and Albertina Rasch, the choreographer of The Band Wagon, The Cat and the Fiddle, and Jubilee.


25. Ibid., 138.

26. See bruce mcclung, “Psicosi per musica.” I am grateful to the author for sharing a typescript of this essay prior to its publication. See also mcclung, “American Dreams: Analyzing Moss Hart, Ira Gershwin, and Kurt Weill’s Lady in the Dark” (Ph.D. dissertation, Eastman School of Music, University of Rochester, 1994) and, more recently, mcclung’s thorough and excellent “Lady in the Dark”: Biography of a Musical.
27. Also much later, Whitlaw Savory would sing the beautiful “Love in a Mist” in the place later reserved for “Westwind.” “Love in a Mist” can be heard in Ben Bagley’s Kurt Weill Revisited Vol. II (Painted Smiles PSCD 109).

28. Another song, “Who Am I?,” which Savory sang in his bedroom early in act II before being surprised by the angry Anatolian Zuvetli, was also dropped after Weill had orchestrated it.

29. A typescript of I Am Listening is located at the State Historical Society in Madison, Wisconsin. The Weill-Gershwin correspondence and other Ira Gershwin documents are housed in the Music Division of the Library of Congress, and Weill’s musical manuscripts are housed at Yale University. Copies of all Hart, Gershwin, and Weill materials for Lady in the Dark are available for study at the Kurt Weill Foundation for Music in New York. I am grateful to all of the above institutions for making these materials accessible to me, especially Harold L. Miller (State Historical Society), Raymond A. White (Library of Congress), Victor Cardell and Kendall Crilly (Yale), and David Farneth (Kurt Weill Foundation). Thanks are also due to Tom Briggs of the Rodgers and Hammerstein Theatre Library for enabling me to examine the full orchestral score of Lady in the Dark.

30. Letter from Weill to Ira Gershwin, September 2, 1940, Music Division, Library of Congress.

31. Ibid.

32. Letter from Weill to Ira Gershwin, September 14, 1940, Music Division, Library of Congress. Since they had cut the Hollywood Dream (but not the Hollywood sequence) and Randy Curtis now had nothing to sing in the second act, all concerned were eager to have this character sing something. The problems with all of Curtis’s music, however, stemmed from the disturbing discovery about the man they had cast in this role, Victor Mature. As Ira Gershwin expressed it in Lyrics on Several Occasions, “when handsome ‘hunk of man’ Mature sang, his heart and the correct key weren’t in it” (144).


34. Gershwin annotations to “The Third Dream Sequence Section 2.”

35. Ibid. In his annotations of November 3, 1967, appended to the texts for “Three Discarded Songs,” Gershwin briefly explains their originally intended place in the show. “Unforgettable,” recorded as “You Are Unforgettable” on Ben Bagley’s Kurt Weill Revisited (Painted Smiles PSCD 108) and “It’s Never Too Late to Mendelssohn” were deleted from the second dream (some of the lyrics of the latter were retained). “Bats about You” “was written for a flash-back scene and supposedly was a song of the late Twenties, sung at a Mapleton High School graduation Dance.” In Kurt Weill: A Handbook, Drew lists “Bats about You” and “You Are Unforgettable” under unlocated songs.

36. Ira Gershwin, Lyrics on Several Occasions, 187. Arthur and Francis were the given names of George and Ira’s lesser known younger siblings. The conclusion of the Wedding Dream (including the Mendelssohn Endlesssohn and Lohengrin and Bear It material) is borrowed from another wedding song, “Bride and Groom,” in the act I finale of Ira’s collaboration with his brother George, Oh, Kay! (1926), starring Lawrence as Lady Kay.


39. Michael Morley offers a possible “common denominator” between “In der Jugend Gold’nem Schimmer” and its reincarnations in Marie Galante and One Touch of Venus. See Morley, “‘I Cannot/Will Not Sing the Old Songs Now’: Some Observations on Weill’s Adaptation of
Notes to Pages 141–147

Popular Song Forms,” in Kim H. Kowalke and Horst Edler, eds., A Stranger Here Myself, 221.
40. Kowalke, Kurt Weill in Europe, 117.
41. Originally published as “Über den gestischen Charakter der Musik.” Weill’s article is translated by Kim H. Kowalke in Kurt Weill in Europe, 491–93 (the quotations in this paragraph are found on p. 493).
42. Ibid., 493.
43. Ibid., 494. The remaining quotations from Weill’s essay are also found on this page.
44. Kowalke, Kurt Weill in Europe, 113–23.
45. The New Harvard Dictionary of Music defines the doctrine of affections as “the belief, widely held in the 17th and early 18th centuries, that the principal aim of music is to arouse the passions or affections (love, hate, joy, anger, fear, etc., conceived as rationalized, discrete, and relatively static states).” Don Randel, ed., The New Harvard Dictionary of Music (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1986), 16.
49. “September Song” from Knickerbocker Holiday, “My Ship” from Lady in the Dark, “Speak Low” from One Touch of Venus, “Green-Up Time” from Love Life, and the title song from Lost in the Stars are perhaps the best known song legacies from Weill’s otherwise currently little-known Broadway shows.
50. Weill, Notes for the original cast recording of Street Scene.
51. Ibid.
52. Ibid.
53. Rodgers explains his ideas about dramatic unity in Chee-Chee (1928) in his autobiography, Musical Stages, 118 (see also chapter 5, p. 85). Larry Stempel notes Rodgers’s early attempt at an integrated musical and adds Hammerstein’s Rose-Marie (1924) to the short list of integrated 1920s musicals (see Stempel, “Street Scene,” 324).
54. William G. King, “Music and Musicians.”
55. In Bob Fosse’s 1972 popular film adaptation of the Weill-influenced Cabaret (1966), for example, the songs that took place outside the Kit Kat Club on Broadway were mostly removed, an artistic decision that deprived the central male character the inalienable right of any central character in a musical: the right to sing.
56. Lady in the Dark (Chappell, 1941). Hart dates his remarks March 18, 1941.
57. Mcclung, “Psicosi per musica,” 242–45.
58. Ibid., 250–63.
59. Howard Barnes of the New York Herald Tribune, October 17, 1943, wrote that Venus was “the first integrated and joyous entertainment of the current theatrical semester.”
61. The subject of quarter-note (and half-note) triplets is introduced in the musical discussion of Anything Goes (see chapter 3, pp. 54–55).
62. Richards, Great Musicals of the American Theatre, Volume 1, 129.
Notes to Pages 149–164

63. Thanks to Robert M. Stevenson, professor emeritus at the University of California at Los Angeles, for this inspired simile.
64. Richards, Great Musicals of the American Theatre, Volume 1, 158.
66. Ibid., 82.
67. Ibid., 79.
68. When Danny Kaye left the show and his role as Russell Paxton, his replacement proved difficult. Within two weeks after Gershwin wrote Weill that Rex O’Malley “is too lady-like for the lady-like characters and may make the character far too realistic,” the production staff bought out his contract. See the letter from Ira Gershwin to Kurt Weill, August 23, 1941, Music Division, Library of Congress.

Chapter 8: Stage versus Screen (1): Before Rodgers and Hammerstein

2. The dancing in “Night and Day” only lasted 4 ½ minutes. “The Continental,” composed by Con Conrad and Herb Magidson, also accomplished what the music by Berlin, Gershwin, Kern, Porter, and Youmans did not: It won the Oscar for best song.
3. The 1955 film Hit the Deck used seven of Youmans’s ten songs, but set the songs to a new book.
4. Three Fred and Ginger films later, Kern and Fields would team up to contribute the complete score to Swing Time.
5. Charles Winninger (Cap’n Andy), Helen Morgan (Julie), and Sammy White (Frank) appeared in the original production and 1932 revival, Paul Robeson played Joe in the 1928 London production and the 1932 revival, and both Irene Dunne (Magnolia) and Allan Jones (Ravenna) had appeared in these roles in other Show Boat performances between 1927 and 1936.
7. Although shot in color, the Preminger Porgy and Bess, withdrawn from circulation by the Gershwin Estate, is also difficult to obtain.
8. Not included in these eighteen minutes is an overture that lasts about fifty-five seconds, which presents an athematic buzz followed by the first phrase of “Ol’ Man River” and opening snippets of “I Have the Room above Her” and “Can’t Help Lovin’ Dat Man.”
9. The stage version opens with the ominous Vallon theme, which in the absence of Vallon appears more generically as a darker force on the river before audiences can make the connection between the theme and Vallon himself. The film waits to introduce Vallon’s theme until we meet Vallon, thirteen minutes into the scene.
10. This is the waltz that begins with “Your pardon I pray,” brings Magnolia into the song, and returns as underscoring when the song is completed. When this theme finally makes its appearance thirty-four minutes into the film it is used to accompany Julie’s departure from the show boat and thus bears no connection with the principal couple. Back to “Make Believe,” the return of the main chorus offers only the first and last lyrics (a reduction from 32 measures to 16).
12. Ruggles can be seen earlier as an aristocrat in Mamoulian’s *Love Me Tonight* (1932) and later as a hunter in the Katharine Hepburn–Cary Grant classic *Bringing Up Baby* (1938).


16. Ibid.


20. *Rent’s* Mimi is memorably described in the satirical Broadway revue *Forbidden Broadway* when it summarizes how the character has evolved from *La Bohème*: “In *La Bohème* she’s a sweet, shy, seamstress. Now, she’s a crackhead, nymphomaniac, prostitute, YEAH!!!” *Forbidden Broadway Strikes Back* DRG 12614 (1997).


22. The film version that was available to me was a non-commercially distributed recording that clocked in at 115 minutes. Depending on the source consulted, the published literature offers film times of about 150 minutes (Berg, *Goldwyn*, 487); “just under two and half hours (with an intermission following Crown’s seduction of Bess, as in many two-act versions of the work)” (Pollack, *George Gershwin*, 649); and 138 minutes according to Stanley Green, *Hollywood Musicals Year by Year,* 220. The Berg and Pollack figures would make the film only thirty-five minutes less than the 1993 Nunn version. Assuming these two authors are correct, the copy I viewed may have been missing portions of the nine reels housed in the Library of Congress available for private viewing. Despite this possible omission, the only major “song” missing in the DVD available to me was “My Man’s Gone Now” (included on the soundtrack). See the discussion of *Pal Joey* for a discrepancy between the timings listed on the package of a commercially distributed video and the contents of the video itself.

23. “The most obvious change is the elimination of some major numbers: the ‘Fuoco di gioia’ chorus in Act I, the Concerted Finale of Act III, and the ‘Willow Song’ of Act IV (Zeffirelli finds it ‘boring,’ even on the stage). In addition, major sections in individual numbers are cut: a few pages of the ‘Vittoria’ chorus (act I), the second stanza of the Drinking Song (I), a large portion of the final stanga of ‘Si pel ciel’ (II), and various passages in the Duet between Otello and Desdemona (III). There are also many small cuts in the semi-declamatory syntax that pervades the work.” Marcia J. Citron, *Opera on Screen*, 75–76.

24. Mamoulian’s notes were published in Tom Milne, *Rouben Mamoulian* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1969), 13, and in Charles Hamm, “The Theatre Guild Production,” 509. The sequence, which bears a strong rhythmic resemblance to the opening drumbeats and some of the rhythmic layering that introduce the Kittiwah scene, appears in a different
place on the soundtrack where it serves as an introduction to “I Can’t Sit Down” after a fragment of “How are you dis morning”?  
25. Foster Hirsch, in “Porgy and Bess—The Film,” 12–13. Hirsch is also the author of books on the Shubert brothers, Kurt Weill, and Harold Prince (see the Bibliography for listings of the latter two).  
26. After presenting the orchestral introduction from the beginning of the scene to Rehearsal 93, the film cuts to Mingo’s announcement of Porgy on the measure before Rehearsal 128 (17 pages of the Vocal Score, 506–522).  
29. The actual strip music is a jazzy version (with growling trumpet) of Luigi Boccherini’s familiar minuet from the Quintet in E Major, op. 11, no. 5 (1771), which had recently figured prominently in the plot of The Ladykillers (1955), starring Alec Guinness.  
30. This is a good place to mention that both Stanley Green, in Hollywood Musicals Year by Year, and the commercial but generally fairly meticulous website IMDb cite 111 minutes as the length of the film; Wikipedia and the covers and liner notes on both the VHS and DVD releases state the timing as 109 minutes. The actual running time is 87 minutes. For various reasons, I think this correction might spare potential viewers considerable anxiety about what could possibly have happened to the twenty or so non-existent minutes they may have been looking forward to.  
31. Turturro claimed that the character of Silvano was based on his own father, an Italian immigrant who fought and died for America at Normandy (Robbins, “‘Cradle Will Rock,’” 69). The creator of the role of Larry Forman, Howard da Silva, also the first Jud Fry in Oklahoma! and Benjamin Franklin in 1776, was blacklisted in Hollywood in the 1950s for refusing to testify before the House Un-American Activities Committee, the progeny of the Dies Committee in the 1930s.  
32. John Houseman, Run-Through, 266.  
33. Ibid., 267.  
34. Tim Robbins, “‘Cradle Will Rock,’” 122–23. According to Houseman, Welles’s final remarks were less dramatic: “We have the honor to present—with the composer at the piano—The Cradle Will Rock.” Houseman, Run-Through, 267.  
36. Ibid., 269.  
37. Although not in the cast of Cradle, Lee was part of the WPA Federal Theater Project and played under Welles in the American Negro production of Macbeth one year before Cradle.  
38. Houseman, Run-Through, 270.  
40. Ibid., 55. When comparing Weill to Blitzstein, Ethan Mordden judges the latter’s politics and artistic legacy harshly: “Weill was a melodist and an artist, who happened for various complex reasons, having to do with the nature of the precarious Weimar Republic, to have collaborated on artwork with Leftists. Blitzstein was a braying stooge of the Communazi Red Front whose work never succeeded and who is virtually forgotten today” (Mordden, Beautiful Mornin’, 144).  
41. Bruce D. McClung, “‘Lady in the Dark,’”: 173–74. According to both Ira Gershwin and Leisen, Rogers had recorded an a cappella version of the whole song.  
42. Ibid., 174.
43. The initial delay in filming was due to Martin’s pregnancy. Production was delayed further as a consequence of a lawsuit filed by Gregory LaCava, who claimed to be the rightful producer and director. Mainly for these reasons, the gestation from the purchase of the film rights to the release of the film original took more than four years.
44. In 1953 he married Rita Hayworth, a fourth marriage for each (ending in 1955).
47. Concerning Weill, in addition to *Lady in the Dark* and *One Touch of Venus*, two other American shows received film treatment. Like the two discussed here, *Knickerbocker Holiday* (1944) eradicated most of Maxwell Anderson’s political satire and bypassed most of the score, retaining only three songs, including the famous “September Song,” and interpolating new ones by Jule Styne, Sammy Cahn, and other lesser known studio composers. In 1974, the American Film Theatre released a relatively faithful and reasonably complete version of *Lost in the Stars*, starring Brock Peters (Crown in the Preminger *Porgy and Bess*) that received generally unfavorable notices.

**Chapter 9: Carousel**

3. David Ewen, *Richard Rodgers*, 236–37. Hammerstein also recalled that Molnár made a “valuable suggestion” during the New Haven tryouts, “which involved playing two scenes in one set—actually a more radical departure from the original than any change we had made” and “proved successful in pulling together a very long second act.” See Oscar Hammerstein, “Turns on a Carousel,” 1.
5. “Guild Scores Again with Its ‘Carousel,’” *New York World-Telegram*, April 20, 1945; review excerpted in Steven Suskin, *Opening Night on Broadway*, 147; reprinted in *New York Theatre Critics’ Reviews*, vol. 6, 226. Since the first edition of *Enchanted Evenings* was among the guilty parties, it is imperative to note that in his recent well-researched archival study Tim Carter “found no evidence for the quite persistent story that ‘[This Was] A Real Nice Clambake’ in *Carousel* derives from a song (“This Was a Real Nice Hayride”) originally intended for *Oklahoma!*” (Tim Carter, “*Oklahoma!* The Making of an American Musical, 285n23).


11. For another interpretation of the relationship between music and drama in Carousel see Larry Stempel’s comparison between the aria “Somehow I Never Could Believe” from Weill’s Street Scene and Billy’s “Soliloquy.” Stempel observes that Hammerstein’s words and not Rodgers’s music “indicate the basic emotional change he [Billy Bigelow] undergoes in thinking about being a father.” Stempel, “Street Scene,” 327.

12. Kern’s shrewd decision to use Magnolia’s piano theme for the release of Ravenal’s song “Where’s the Mate for Me?” (Example 2.4) lets audiences know immediately that Magnolia has entered Ravenal’s consciousness and foreshadows their eventual union. At the end of Ravenal’s song Magnolia appears as if in answer to the question posed in the song’s title, and Ravenal is unable to complete his final words, “for me.” After some underscored dialogue Ravenal admits within the song “Make Believe” that his love for Magnolia is not a pretense but a reality (“For, to tell the truth, I do”). Versions of Show Boat differ on whether or not Magnolia actually says the magic words “I do” at the conclusion of their duet, but no one in the audience can seriously doubt that after “Make Believe” her love for Ravenal is the real thing.


15. Ibid., 100.

16. Although the published vocal score (Williamson Music Co.) lists the scene between Julie and Billy as act I, scene 1 (following the pantomimed Prelude), the published libretto identifies the scene as act I, scene 2. See Six Plays.

17. Ibid., 93–94.

18. Quotation in Rodgers, Musical Stages, 236. State Fair was released in August 1945, several months after the April opening of Carousel.

19. Ibid.

20. The words “dozens of boys,” “many a likely,” “does what he can,” “she has a few,” and “fellers of two” also display these untied and metrically neutral eighth-note triplets. During the opening thoughts in the “Soliloquy” (when Billy imagines that he will be having a son), he sings metrically challenging quarter-note triplets tied to quarter notes (e.g., “The old man!” and “Of his Dad”). See the introduction of the quarter-note triplet in chapter 3, 54–55.

The eighth-note triplets that Billy and Julie sing do not go against the metrical grain as Reno Sweeney’s half-note triplets do in “I Get a Kick Out of You” (the bracketed words and syllables in “Mere al-co-[hol doesn’t thrill me at] all, / so [tell me why should it be] true” and Example 3.1a). Nevertheless, they do help to establish a distinct and slightly askew rhythmic plane (especially when preceded by ties in “If I Loved You”), just as Billy and Julie try unsuccessfully to thwart society’s expectations. Four measures of triplets appear in succession in Billy’s “Soliloquy” (in duple meter) on the words that describe the future Billy Jr. and Billy himself: “No pot-bellied, baggy-eyed bully’ll boss him a round” (in Example 9.4a), later with the words, “No fat bottomed, flabby-faced, pot-bellied, baggy-eyed bastard’ll boss him around.”

21. David Ewen writes that the Carousel waltzes were taken from a work called Waltz Suite that Paul Whiteman had commissioned but never performed (Ewen, Richard Rodgers, 239).
Rodgers, who in his autobiography recalls two other associations with Whiteman in 1935 and 1936, is silent on this point.

22. “Two Little People” does not appear as a separate title in the vocal score (Williamson Music Co., 43–47), but Hammerstein does so title this music in his Lyrics, 142. Also in Lyrics Hammerstein includes a stanza that does not appear in the published vocal score: “There’s a feathery little cloud floatin’ by / Like a lonely leaf on a big blue stream. / And two people—you and I—/ Who cares what we dream?” Hammerstein’s stanza does appear, however, in the holograph manuscript in the Music Division of the Library of Congress where it is sung by Julie to music that is altered only on the words, “leaf on a big blue stream” (g-f-e♭-d-c-d). In his holograph score Rodgers entered a sketch labeled “2 little people” that does not correspond either to Hammerstein’s text or to Rodgers’s final version.

23. Aside from Julie’s complementary stanza discussed in the previous note, the only major changes between Rodgers’s holograph and the published vocal score are those of key and the absence of dotted rhythms in the D-major sketch. Not only does Rodgers place “If I Loved You” in C major in the holograph, he also places the first page of “Scene Billy and Julie” in F♯ major and G major instead of G major and A♭ major, 33; he also assigns the “mill theme” (Example 9.1) to D major in both of its appearances rather than G major and E♭ major as in the published score, 38–39 and 47–48, respectively.

24. The idea of retaining an accompaniment figure for the sake of musical unity rather than for a demonstrable dramatic purpose was earlier evident in On Your Toes (“There’s a Small Hotel” and the principal tune of “Slaughter on 10th Avenue”).

25. When in act II Carrie imitates one of the “hussies with nothin’ on their legs but tights” that she saw in New York, her music also clearly echoes the music associated with Julie’s name (“You’re a queer one, Julie Jordan”) that Carrie introduced early in act I (“I’m a Tomboy, jest a Tomboy”). Appropriately, the stage directions indicate that “Mr. Snow enters with Snow Jr. and interrupts song.”


28. This quotation was Boswell’s adaptation of the medieval dictum, also appropriate in this context, “to cite heresy is not to be a heretic.” John Boswell, Christianity, Social Tolerance, and Homosexuality (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), xvii.


30. Rodgers, Musical Stages, 156.

31. Ibid., 236.

32. Joseph P. Swain discusses how augmented triads and modality also serve to establish an individual character and identity for Carousel. See Swain, The Broadway Musical, 99–127. An especially poignant use of the augmented triad (F-A♯-D♭) occurs on the fourth measure of “If I Loved You” (Example 9.5a) where it follows a simple but extremely effective harmonic progression in measures 1–3, a musical embodiment of the joys and soft terrors of a hypothetical romance: a D♭-major triad on measure 1, a D♭–diminished seventh on measure 2 that never fails to surprise and delight, and a D♭-major triad in first inversion (F in the bass) on measure 3 that gently prepares for the augmented triad on F in measure 4.

33. I Remember Mama was based on the first play that Rodgers and Hammerstein produced on Broadway, John Van Druten’s hit play of the same title, which opened its long run of
714 performances in 1944. In 1967 Rodgers wrote eight songs for a televised adaptation of Shaw’s *Androcles and the Lion* that featured Norman Wisdom as Androcles, Geoffrey Holder as the Lion, and Noël Coward as Caesar. For more on Rodgers’s final musicals see Geoffrey Block, *Richard Rodgers*, 202–55.

34. Perhaps the least known of their adaptations, *Pipe Dream* (1955), based on John Steinbeck’s *Sweet Thursday*, ended up as their major disappointment; despite an enthusiastic review from Brooks Atkinson in the *New York Times*, it ran only 246 performances, less than either *Allegro* (315) or *Me and Juliet* (358). Their final musicals, both adaptations, produced one modest success, *Flower Drum Song* in 1958 (600 performances), and their fifth major hit, *The Sound of Music* in 1959, at 1,443 performances the second longest running musical of the 1950s (after *My Fair Lady*) and the fourth longest running show before 1960. In addition to these stage shows Rodgers and Hammerstein wrote *Cinderella*, a ninety-minute musical for television starring Julie Andrews broadcast on March 31, 1957; during Rodgers’s lifetime a remake starring Lesley Ann Warren was broadcast on February 22, 1965, and a third televised remake starring Brandy Norwood followed on November 2, 1997.

Chapter 10: Kiss Me, Kate

1. According to Steven Suskin’s “Broadway Scorecard,” *Kiss Me, Kate* received eight “raves” and one “favorable” review and no reviews in the lower categories (“mixed,” “unfavorable,” and “pan”). See Suskin, *Opening Night on Broadway*, 367. Of the musicals surveyed in this book only *Guys and Dolls* and *My Fair Lady* would receive no reviews lower than a “rave.”

2. Stanley Green, *The World of Musical Comedy*, 156. The first sentence of the Porter quotation appears in Richard G. Hubler, *The Cole Porter Story*, 90; in the annotated Hubler interview Porter goes on to say without further explanation that Rodgers and Hammerstein “are, let us say, more musicianly.”

3. The only known commodity in the *Kiss Me, Kate* cast was Alfred Drake (Fred Graham/Petruchio), who had earlier achieved stardom as the original Curley in *Oklahoma!*


5. The Porter Collection also contains sketch material, the May libretto, and copies of the discarded songs.


8. This book will be referred to as the Spewack libretto draft or the May libretto.


10. Stephen Citron cites additional borrowings “from native Italian dances, especially the Venetian boat song, and the canzones [canzonas] of Sorrento” in “Where Is the Life That Late I Led?” Joseph P. Swain mentions the use of the modal flat seventh degree, a typical melodic figure in Renaissance music (e.g., B♭ in the key of C) rather than the more tonal B♭ that marks most European music after 1600). See Citron, *Noel & Cole*, 307, and Swain, *The Broadway Musical*, 133–34.

11. Citron notes another possible musical pun in the verse of “Where Is the Life That Late I Led?”: “And one cannot overlook Porter’s use of the Neapolitan sixth chord 3 bars before the verse’s end. Was Cole pulling our leg?” Stephen Citron, *Noel & Cole*, 309. Unfortunately, the Verdian orchestral tag at the end of “We Open in Venice” (shown in Example 9.1) vanished in the 1999 Broadway revival and recording.
12. According to Swain, the Baltimore songs “have no structural consistency, and show instead Porter’s vaunted and bewildering eclecticism.” Swain, The Broadway Musical, 138.
13. Perfect fourths also begin nearly every musical phrase in “Tom, Dick or Harry” and appear prominently in the finale to act I (see the vocal score published by Tams-Witmark, 118–20).
14. Among Porter’s drafts are a “minuet” version labeled “Bianca’s Theme,” an eighteenth-century dance that would soon give way to Lois’s song “Why Can’t You Behave?” in act I and its transformation into a Renaissance pavane for Bianca in act II (Example 10.4). Several labeled drafts in piano score also reveal that Porter abandoned an earlier idea to characterize Petruchio and Katherine with musical signatures.
15. “I Sing of Love” was excluded from both the original cast album issued in 1949 and its stereo re-recording (with most of the original principals) ten years later. See Discography and Filmography in the online website.
16. In the act II finale Porter returns to a guitar-like accompaniment (rather than a lute-like accompaniment as befits the Renaissance) that is similar to his first serenade to Kate in “Were Thine That Special Face,” now altered to triple meter.
17. The consistency with which Porter tried to create musical linkages among the songs is further demonstrated in at least four songs that were removed before the Broadway opening. In “It Was Great Fun the First Time” Porter presents a melody that will anticipate the distinctive melodic figure with its turn to minor that will appear in “I Sing of Love” and “Where Is the Life?”; another phrase in the song foreshadows the verse of “Bianca” (at that point probably unwritten). “We Shall Never Be Younger” exhibits an emphasis on perfect fourths suggestive of “Another Op’nin” and “Why Can’t You Behave?,” and a phrase in “A Woman’s Career” closely resembles a phrase in “Too Darn Hot” without any particular dramatic justification. Finally, the discarded “What Does Your Servant Dream About?” also with many perfect fourths, opens with a vamp that is nearly identical to the conclusion of “I’ve Come to Wive It Wealthily in Padua.”
21. “Patricia Morison and Miles Kreuger Discuss the Deleted Songs July 5, 1990,” Notes to Kiss Me, Kate, conducted by John McGlinn (EMI/Angel CDS 54033–2), 15.
22. Neither Spewack nor Eells has anything to say about the history of the two other songs that Porter added between June and November: “So in Love” and “I Hate Men.” The only dated typescript of “I Hate Men” shows the late date November 18.
23. These Shakespeare passages can be found in the final scene of the May libretto, act II, scene 7.
24. Morison had the following recollection: “In the scripts that were given to me by Bella Spewack, the song ["A Woman’s Career"] is performed by a character named Angela Temple, a friend and confidant of Lilli Vanessi” (Patricia Morison and Miles Kreuger, “Patricia Morison and Miles Kreuger Discuss the Deleted Songs,” 15). In the May Spewack libretto, however, “A Woman’s Career” was to be sung by Fred Graham to conclude act II, scene 5.
27. Eells, The Life That Late He Led, 244.
28. In addition to “It Was Great Fun the First Time” and “We Shall Never Be Younger,” the May libretto included two other songs that would be dropped: “If Ever Married I’m” (sung by
Bianca in act I, scene 7), and “A Woman’s Career” (sung by Fred in act II, scene 5). Another two songs, also discarded before the Philadelphia tryouts, were probably introduced after the May libretto.

The first of these, “What Does Your Servant Dream About?” can be placed quite accurately, since Porter’s draft indicated “Opening Act 2, Scene 3,” and “Curtis and Lackeys.” No such indication occurs in the May libretto, although Curtis and other servants do appear in the opening of the scene to the accompaniment of “Where Is the Life?” A Porter lyric typescript for “What Does Your Servant Dream About?” is dated July 10.

The chronology and placement of the other later addition (also soon to be deleted), “I’m Afraid, Sweetheart, I Love You,” is less clear, since neither Porter nor the Spewacks offer clues as to who should be singing this song and where. Presumably this song, too, came and went between June and November, perhaps around the time of Porter’s August 7 typescript copy.

Lyrics to all of these songs are reprinted in *The Complete Lyrics of Cole Porter* and are included in John McGlinn’s first complete recording of *Kiss Me, Kate* issued in 1990. Unfortunately, several of Morison’s recollections (for example, that “It Was Great Fun the First Time” and “If Ever Married I’m” were replaced by “Wunderbar” and “Tom, Dick or Harry,” respectively) are at odds with the information provided by the May libretto. See note 17 for a summary of the musical similarities between the discarded songs and those retained.

29. The reprise of “E lucevan le stelle” in act III of Puccini’s *Tosca*, an opera notoriously described by Kerman as a “shabby little shocker,” offers a more publicized example of a similar problem. As Kerman wrote: “Tosca leaps, and the orchestra screams the first thing that comes into its head, ‘E lucevan le stelle.’ How pointless this is, compared with the return of the music for the kiss at the analogous place in *Otello*, which makes Verdi’s dramatic point with a consummate sense of dramatic form . . . . ‘E lucevan le stelle’ is all about self-pity; Tosca herself never heard it.” Joseph Kerman, *Opera as Drama*, 15.

Although Kerman’s overall assessment of *Tosca*’s artistic worth has not gone unchallenged, even sympathetic Puccini scholars such as Roger Parker and Mosco Carner understand Kerman’s “exasperation.” Like Kerman, Parker concludes that “the theme is that of Cavaradossi’s soliloquy earlier in the third act; Tosca has had no opportunity to hear it; what we see and what we hear seem out of joint.” Roger Parker, “Analysis: Act I in perspective,” in Mosco Carner, *Giacomo Puccini: “Tosca”* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 138.

30. The terms “theatrical truth” and “literal truth” are used by Sondheim in his assessment in 1985 of the most effective placement of “Gee, Officer Krupke” in *West Side Story*. Otis, L. Guernsey Jr., ed., *Broadway Song & Story*, 50.

31. In adopting Shakespeare, Porter first uses the eight lines that begin with “I am ashamed that women are so simple” and ends with “should well agree with our external parts.” He then replaces Shakespeare’s “Then vail your stomachs, for it is no boot, / And place your hands below your husband’s foot” with “So wife, hold your temper and meekly put / Your hand ‘neath the sole of your husband’s foot.” Porter’s final two lines agree with Shakespeare’s external rhymes (although the composer adds a second “ready” in the last line).


35. Germaine Greer, *The Female Eunuch* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1971), 206. More recently, Harold Bloom offers a thoughtful and spirited defense of *Kiss Me, Kate* on social grounds, for example: “One would have to be tone deaf (or ideologically crazed) not to hear in this [Act V, scene 1, lines 130–38] a subtly exquisite music of marriage at its happiest” (Harold Bloom, *Shakespeare: The Invention of the Human*, 28–35; quotation on 33).


37. I am indebted to my colleague Peter Greenfield, professor of English at the University of Puget Sound, for pointing out the “play” interpretation.

38. See, for example, Catherine Clément’s feminist indictment of the operatic tradition, *Opera, or the Undoing of Women* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1988), and Susan McClary, *Feminine Endings* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991).

**Chapter 11: Guys and Dolls and The Most Happy Fella**

1. This last Broadway revival of *The Most Happy Fella* was again upstaged in the Best Revival category by the splashier and fully orchestrated revival of *Guys and Dolls* (the *Fella* revival offered only two pianos).


4. Styne’s *High Button Shoes* (1947) and *Gentlemen Prefer Blondes* (1949) and Lane’s *Finian’s Rainbow* (1947) were the earliest successes of these prominent Broadway composers.


6. In his notes to the 1958 original London cast recording of *Where’s Charley?*, Stanley Green noted that “at the time of its closing, its 792 performances made it the tenth longest-running musical in Broadway history” (Monmouth-Evergreen MES/7029). See also Riis, 50–73.


11. On June 29, 1994, this production became the longest running revival in Broadway history up to that time.

12. William Kennedy, “The Runyonland Express Is Back in Town,” *New York Times*, April 12, 1992, sec. 2, 1 and 26, and Jo Swerling Jr., “Abe Burrows: Undue Credit?,” *New York Times*, May 3, 1992, sec. 2, 4 (with a response from William Kennedy). Those familiar with the machinations of Hollywood screenplays will recognize the terms of Swerling’s contract that allowed him to receive primary credit as the libretto’s author, even if none of his work was used. It is difficult to credit the notion espoused by Swerling’s son that Feuer, Martin, and stage manager Henri Caubisens conspired with Burrows to diminish Swerling’s role in the *Guys and Dolls* drama. Burrows’s account is also corroborated in Susan Loesser, *A Most Remarkable Fella*, 101–02.

15. The quasi-triplets created by two groups of three eighth notes (in 6/8 time) also pervade Adelaide’s admonishment of Nathan in “Sue Me.”
16. Late in the show when Sarah sings her duet with Adelaide, “Marry the Man Today,” her evolution is complete and triplets (albeit of the common eighth-note variety) become the dominant rhythm.
17. Tonic (4 measures), dominant (2 measures), tonic (6 measures), dominant (2 measures), and tonic (1 measure).
18. A leading Italian bass at La Scala (1921–24) and the Metropolitan Opera (1926–1948), Pinza was introduced in chapter 9 as the first internationally known opera singer to star on Broadway (South Pacific [1949]).
19. Another song intended to feature Nathan and Sky, “Travelin’ Light,” was one of several songs dropped from the show. It is included in An Evening with Frank Loesser: Frank Loesser Performs Songs from His Hit Shows (DRG 5169).
21. Ironically, one of these new songs, “Adelaide,” was given to Nathan, played by Frank Sinatra.
22. Block, “Frank Loesser’s Sketchbooks.”
24. Ibid., 2842. This undated sketch page is found sandwiched between other pages dated December 1953.
25. “Abbondanza” sketches (first sketched as “The Helps”), unlike the sketches for “Lovers in the Lane,” were dated precisely by Loesser in December 1953. Ibid., 2851 and 2859–62.
26. Ibid., 3006–07.
27. Loesser, “Some Loesser Thoughts on ‘The Most Happy Fella.’”
28. Ibid. Loesser expresses the same sentiment in “Some Notes on a Musical.”
29. Loesser, “Some Loesser Thoughts on ‘The Most Happy Fella.’”
40. Ibid., 5.
41. Ibid.
42. Ibid., 17.
43. According to Abba Bogin, Loesser’s musical assistant and rehearsal pianist in Fella and a reliable source of practical and anecdotal information, “Ooh! My Feet” was originally intended for Lieutenant Branigan in Guys and Dolls. See Block, “Frank Loesser’s Sketchbooks,” 77–78.
44. Loesser Collection, 3004. A transcription of this “Big D” draft appears in Block, “Frank Loesser’s Sketchbooks,” 65.
45. Loesser Collection, 2794, 2811, 2857–58, 2900–01, and 2915.
46. Loesser, “Some Loesser Thoughts on ‘The Most Happy Fella.’”
47. In the previous chapter it was suggested that Porter deprived Kiss Me, Kate of dramatic nuance when he departed from his conceit that the Padua songs would distinguish themselves from the Baltimore songs through contrasting statements in the major and minor modes.
49. Sometimes Loesser’s melodic manipulations can be subtle to the point of inaudibility for most listeners. For example, a transformed version of the “Tony” motive (the seconds have now been inverted to become sevenths) can be detected during the final moments of act I, when Rosabella “overcomes her resistance” and willingly accepts Joe’s sexual advances. During the course of their kiss the “Tony” motive returns to the “sighing” seconds that underscored Tony’s imaginary conversation. Vocal score, 126.
Moments later (near the beginning of act II) Loesser inserts another small musical detail that conveys a dramatic message. In the fleeting moment between choruses of the uplifting “Fresno Beauties” Joe and Rosabella sing their private thoughts in a duet that neither can hear. The interval that separates the one-night lovers is the same minor seventh that brought them together in the seduction music ending act I. Ibid., 133.
51. Ibid., 252–53.
52. Ibid., 257.

Chapter 12: My Fair Lady

1. My Fair Lady’s performance run was not surpassed until nearly a decade later by Hello, Dolly! in 1971.
4. Rex Harrison, Rex: An Autobiography, 114. According to Gene Lees, Porter was one of the many who had turned down the Pygmalion adaptation (see note 17). Gene Lees, Inventing Champagne: The Worlds of Lerner and Loewe, 88.


11. It was noted in the previous chapter that the revue *The Illustrators Show*, which folded after five performances, also marked the Broadway debut of Loesser, who wrote the lyrics of several Irving Actman songs for this same show.


13. Laurence, ed., *Bernard Shaw Collected Letters 1911–1925*, (New York: Viking, 1985), 730–31. It is clear from this letter, however, that Shaw’s motives were as much financial as they were artistic.


19. In contrast to the Rodgers and Hammerstein prototype, in which the secondary characters show some emotional or comic bond and sing to or about one another, *My Fair Lady* audiences never actually meet Doolittle’s bride.


22. Harrison attributed his idiosyncratic combination of speaking and singing to conductor Bill Low. According to Harrison, Low informed him that “there is such a thing as talking on pitch—using only those notes that you want to use, picking them out of the score, sometimes more, sometimes less. For the rest of the time, concentrate on staying on pitch, even though you’re only speaking.” Harrison, *Rex: An Autobiography*, 108.

24. Lyricist-composers Porter and Loesser similarly gave their songs a title before composing a tune. Lerner also shared the frustrations suffered by fellow lyricist-librettist Hammerstein. While falling somewhat short of Rodgers’s legendary speed (e.g., “Bali Ha’i” allegedly in five minutes, “Happy Talk” in twenty), the comparative ease and rapidity with which Loewe composed melodies was a fate that Lerner too had to endure.

25. Lerner, The Street Where I Live, 70.


27. Just as “Say a Prayer” would return two years later in the film Gigi, the main theme of “Promenade” would return in both the film and subsequent stage versions of this show as “She Is Not Thinking of Me.”

28. The chronology of “The Servants’ Chorus” must remain conjectural. The most likely hypothesis is that it followed the inception of “The Rain in Spain” during rehearsals. The fact that the lyrics were added in pen in the Library of Congress holograph score suggests, but does not confirm, that they were a late addition.

29. Lerner, The Street Where I Live, 70.


31. The holograph does not display a text over the underscoring as found on the vocal score (152 and 159) or the right-hand accompaniment figure that is prominently featured a little later (160 and 161). Also in the holograph the word “aren’” (to rhyme with “foreign”) appears as “aren’t.”

32. A complete list for the spoken passages in the three mentioned Higgins songs follows: “I’m an Ordinary Man” (“I’m an ordinary man,” “But let a . . . ” [all three times], “I’m a very gentle man,” and “I’m a quiet-living man”) [the final spoken “Let a woman in your life” does not appear on the holograph in any form]; “A Hymn to Him” (“What in all of Heaven could have prompted her to . . . ” [the next word “go” is sung] and “Why can’t a . . . ” [the next word “woman” is sung]; and “I’ve Grown Accustomed to Her Face” (“I can see her now,” “In a . . . ,” and “I’m a most forgiving man”).

Despite this increased tendency to replace song with speech-song, the holograph indicates that some passages were originally spoken. For example: “A Hymn to Him” (“Why can’t a woman be like that?,” “Why can’t a woman be like you?,” and “Why can’t a woman be like us?”); and “I’ve Grown Accustomed to Her Face” (“Damn!! Damn!! Damn!! Damn!!” and “I’ve grown accustomed to her face!” at the beginning of the song, and later the “quasi recitative” “Poor Eliza! How simply frightful! How humiliating! How delightful!”). It should also be noted that the holograph of the opening three syllables in Doolittle’s “With a Little Bit of Luck,” “The Lord a-,” indicates three sung pitches, a rising scale G-A-B leading to a C on “bove.”
Notes to Pages 266–276

34. As late as February 23, 1948, ten years after the film version of Pygmalion, Shaw would write, “I absolutely forbid the Campbell interpolation [‘What size’] or any suggestion that the middle-aged bully and the girl of eighteen are lovers.” Laurence, ed., Collected Letters 1926–1950, 815.
37. Ibid., 340.
38. Donald P. Costello, The Serpent’s Eye: Shaw and the Cinema. Costello discusses each of the fourteen scenes that appear in the film but not its screenplay; he also offers a useful appendix, “From Play to Screen Play to Sound Track: A Textual Comparison of Three Versions of Act V of Shaw’s Pygmalion.”
41. Pygmalion/My Fair Lady, 93–94. The remaining quotations in this paragraph can be found on p. 94.
42. Costello, The Serpent’s Eye, 76.
43. Considering its indebtedness to the Pascal film, it is not surprising that on the title page of the My Fair Lady vocal score, Lerner and Loewe were requested to include the phrase “adapted from Bernard Shaw’s ‘Pygmalion’ produced on the screen by Gabriel Pascal,” and that Pascal would receive 1 percent of the My Fair Lady royalties. Costello, The Serpent’s Eye, 68.
44. The exercises themselves appeared in the film (but not the published screenplay): “The rain in Spain stays mainly in the plain” for vowels and “in Hertford, Hereford, and Hampshire hurricanes hardly ever happen” for aspirate h’s. See the stage photograph of this latter exercise on p. 271 and its counterpart in the film on p. 323.
45. Pygmalion/My Fair Lady, 140.
46. The opening notes of Loewe’s melody are identical to the opening of Brahms’s intermezzo for piano in C# minor, op. 117, no. 3. On the subject of musical quotation, Tosca’s “Non la sospiri la nostra casetta” in act I of her opera bears an uncanny melodic resemblance to Doolittle’s “With a Little Bit of Luck.” In contrast to Blitzstein’s and Bernstein’s significant classical borrowings, neither of these possible My Fair Lady borrowings was apparently chosen to make a dramatic point.
48. Ibid., 199.
49. More remote and perhaps unintentional are the melodic correspondences between the opening A sections of “On the Street Where You Live” and “I’ve Grown Accustomed to Her Face.” In any event, it makes sense that a dramatically transformed Higgins would sing a variation of Freddy’s lovesick tune. After all, Higgins could easily have heard Freddy’s song on any number of the many occasions Eliza’s would-be suitor performed it under his window. Although the causes are less dramatically explicable, it is also arguable that “On the Street Where You Live” is melodically derived from “I Could Have Danced All Night.”
50. It might be recalled that the rhythm of “Get Me to the Church on Time” was anticipated in the middle portion of “Just You Wait,” where it was preceded by an upbeat.
51. The full text of “Come to the Ball” is located in Benny Green, ed., A Hymn to Him: The Lyrics of Alan Jay Lerner, 109–10. Loewe’s holograph score can be found in folder 15 of the Loewe Collection, Music Division, Library of Congress.
52. Lerner, The Street Where I Live, 88–89.
53. Ibid., 106.
54. Ibid., 106–7. Lerner went on to explain how “quite unwittingly, the new scene also solved our one major costume problem.” In contrast to the original ball scene when Eliza’s elegant gown was unable to stand out from the splendor of the other gowns, “in the new scene she appeared at the top of the stairs in Higgins’ house in her ball gown, and the audience broke into applause.” Ibid., 108.
55. The original text of “On the Street Where You Live” appears in Green, ed., A Hymn to Him, 96. Lerner commented on and performed the opening night version of this song in “An Evening with Alan Jay Lerner” at the 92nd Street Y, December 12, 1971 (Book-of-the-Month Records 70–524; re-released on DRG 5175 [1977])
56. Shaw introduces Freddy and his ineffectual attempts to hail a cab as well as his sister Clara in act I; Lerner and Loewe do not present Freddy until Ascot, and they drop the role of Clara altogether.
57. Lehman Engel, Words with Music, 116. All quotations in this and the following paragraph can be found on p. 116.
58. In contrast to Engel, Lerner described “the flagrantly romantic lyric that kept edging on the absurd” as “exactly right for the character.” Lerner, The Street Where I Live, 106.
60. The demise of Dorothy and DuBose Heyward’s Porgy, Sidney Howard’s They Knew What They Wanted, and Ferenc Molnár’s Liliom, and their displacement by Porgy and Bess, The Most Happy Fella, and Carousel has been accepted with equanimity by theater audiences and producers. Fortunately, Shakespeare’s The Taming of the Shrew and Romeo and Juliet have so far been spared a similar fate.
61. Pygmalion/My Fair Lady, 43. The original Mrs. Patrick Campbell was a youthful forty-eight at the time she introduced the role of Eliza.
63. For all of Lerner’s shows after Camelot see Benny Green, ed., A Hymn to Him for Lerner’s lyrics, and, in the case of My Man Godfrey, his outline and scenario.

Chapter 13: West Side Story

1. In his autobiography Harold Prince acknowledged that he closed the show six months prematurely. Harold Prince, Contradictions, 39–40.
2. West Side Story was surpassed in first-run longevity by twenty-two shows that premiered before 1960 (see “The Forty Longest Running Musicals on Broadway 1920–1959 and 1920–2008 in the online website), including several concurrent hits that had not yet completed their initial runs: Damn Yankees, The Pajama Game, Bells Are Ringing, and, of course, My Fair Lady, which opened the year before. Meredith Willson’s The Music Man, which first paraded on Broadway two months after West Side Story and eventually ran for 1,375 performances, also eclipsed the Romeo and Juliet adaptation when it won the Tony for best musical of 1957. The London version of West Side Story was voted the Best Musical of the Year 1960. If one were to take into account the return engagement that directly followed West Side Story’s tour, however, its place in the 1920–1959 list would rise to fourteenth and the 985 performance total would move West Side Story up to eighth place on the Broadway scoreboard for the decade, less than 100 performances below Pajama Game and Damn Yankees in sixth and seventh position, respectively. The point is that despite the difficulty of raising the needed $350,000, despite the cast of virtual unknowns, despite the fact that about a hundred people
walked out night after night in response to its grim subject matter, West Side Story was a hit.


7. Quotation in Stephen Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 39. Not until 1988 would a movie (The Last Emperor) capture as many Academy Awards (see chapter 14 for specific details).

8. Bernstein’s log was reprinted in Findings, 144–47, and in 1985 with the jacket notes to Bernstein’s recording, Deutsche Grammophon 4125253–1/4. References to this log will be keyed to the pagination in Findings.


12. The manuscript evidence suggests that the discrepancies among the recollections are greatly exaggerated in Joan Peyser’s relentlessly negative Bernstein biography, in which she accuses the collaborators of deliberate lying. See Peyser, Leonard Bernstein, 255–77.

13. The eight libretto drafts are dated as follows: (1) January 1956; (2) Spring 1956; (3) March 15, 1956; (4) Winter 1956; (5) April 14, 1957; (6) May 1, 1957; (7) June 1, 1957; and (8) July 19, 1957. I am grateful to Harold L. Miller and the State Historical Society of Wisconsin for making these and other West Side Story materials available to me.


17. Candide would open the first of its disappointing seventy-three performances on December 1, 1956.


19. Bernstein’s 1957 entries are located in Bernstein, Findings, 146–47.

20. “Mambo” was reprised on the drugstore juke box late in act II when the Jets are taunting Anita (Taunting Scene). Gussow, “‘West Side Story’: The Beginning of Something Great.”

21. Ibid.


23. Gussow, “‘West Side Story’: The Beginning of Something Great.”
24. Ibid. The undeniable organicism of the work and Bernstein’s awareness of musical technique makes one skeptical of the composer’s remark that he “didn’t do all this on purpose.”


26. Another possible melodic source for the opening of “Somewhere” is a prominent lyrical theme in Richard Strauss’s youthful Burleske for piano and orchestra (1885–1886). See chapter 12, note 46.

27. Peyser, Leonard Bernstein, 261. Despite its borrowed origins, Bernstein remembered that it “took longer to write that song [“Maria”] than any other” because “it’s difficult to make a strong love song and avoid corn.” See Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 21.

The principal certain or possible borrowings are derived from Tchaikovsky’s Romeo and Juliet (and perhaps Beethoven’s “Emperor” Concerto), Blitzstein’s Regina (previously discussed and illustrated with Bernstein’s transformations in Examples 13.1 and 13.2), the Shofar call or Berg’s Piano Sonata, op. 1 (the latter shown in Example 13.9), and Wagner’s “redemption” motive from Die Walküre (Example 13.8). Other possibilities include the following: “America” (Ravel’s “Chansons romanesque” from Don Quichotte [1933] and Copland’s El Salón México [1936], the latter a work which Bernstein had arranged for solo piano in 1941); “Tonight” (Quintet) (Stravinsky’s Symphony of Psalms, third movement [1930]); and “I Feel Pretty” (Ravel’s Rhapsodie Espagnole [1908]). The Stravinsky reference appears in Stempel, “Broadway’s Mozartean Moment,” 48. For another possible Beethoven borrowing, see note 73.

Gradenwitz overstates the musical resemblance between the opening measure of the Balcony Scene and the first four notes of Britten’s “Goodnight Theme” from act I of The Rape of Lucretia, the recently published score of which Bernstein noticed in Gradenwitz’s “modest private apartment.” Peyser fixes a date (1946) to this occasion and adds that Bernstein was then attending rehearsals of the work prior to its premiere. Her statement that “ ‘Tonight’ was derived from Benjamin Britten” similarly places far too great a burden on this four-note descending scale. See Peter Gradenwitz, Leonard Bernstein, 193 and Peyser, Leonard Bernstein, 365–66.

28. The libretto drafts of January and Spring 1956 describe the bridal shop song as “light and gay,” a description that fits “Oh, Happy We” but not “One Hand, One Heart,” which until the Washington tryouts in August 1957 “had only a dotted half note to each bar.” Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 23 (see also note 35).


30. Other material would be altered or discarded in 1957. Instead of a Dream Ballet, the librettos before April 14 indicated a scene in a police station where the death of Bernardo and Riff, unknown to the Sharks and the Jets, would be announced. In the police station Tony and Maria would reenact their meeting at the dance and decide to elope, and Chino would utter the immortal words, “Life, liberty . . . and the pursuit of crapiness.” In the drugstore scene before the climax of the drama in the final 1956 version, Maria rather than Anita was taunted by the Jets. Not until the final months before rehearsals began did the creators of West Side Story succeed in finding a substitute for the philter.

31. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 44. The first two libretto drafts (January and Spring 1956) contained one song in an opening scene, the “Rumble Song.” Judging from an earlier musical draft of the actual Rumble, the “Rumble Song” of early 1956 and the song “Mix” were probably one and the same, but since no lyrics are given in the libretto, this conclusion cannot be established with certainty. In any event, by the third libretto draft (March 15), the concluding song of the scene is in fact labeled “Mix” (in the fourth libretto draft, however,
Notes to Pages 287–290

“Mix” is not indicated. The early libretto drafts also suggest that two songs, “Up to the Moon” and “My Greatest Day,” based on the eventual Prologue and “Jet Song,” respectively, preceded “Mix.”

32. Bernstein would reuse a melody from “Mix,” also discarded from the Prologue, in the Blues portion of “Dance at the Gym.” A version of this idea (with some different lyrics) was retained in the published vocal score, 20–21, as part of the “Jet Song,” and accompanied by a note that this material was cut in the New York production.

33. Laurents’s fifth and sixth libretto drafts still indicate only one song in the Prologue, “Mix”; the seventh and eighth drafts (June 1 and July 19) contain a song for the Jets called “We’re the Greatest” and a reference in the dialogue to another ephemeral song, “This Turf Is Ours.” Shortly before rehearsals “Mix” was finally dropped. Although it is more difficult to date the “new” Rumble, the rehearsal period certainly marks a terminal date for the replacement of a Rumble (based on “Mix”) with the present version. Bernstein recalls in his interview with Gussow that “Mix” “wound up in ‘The Chichester Psalms’ in Hebrew.” See Gussow, “‘West Side Story’: The Beginning of Something Great” and Chichester Psalms II (Amberson/Boosey & Hawkes), 38–50.

34. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 45. Sondheim also confirms the reference to “This Turf Is Ours” in an interview reported in Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 24: “Then we wrote a new opening because everyone felt the opening wasn’t violent enough. The new opening was really violent and everyone thought it was too violent, so we went back to the ‘Jet Song.’” Like “Mix,” “This Turf Is Ours” resurfaced in another Bernstein work when it was incorporated in the Fanfare for the Inauguration of John F. Kennedy (January 19, 1961). Its opening motive is nearly identical to the “hate” motive (see Example 13.9a).

35. Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 23–24. Sondheim also has more to say about the aptly titled “One”: “I remember that the tune of ‘One Hand, One Heart,’ which Bernstein originally wrote for Candide, had only a dotted half note to each bar. I realized I couldn’t set any two-syllable words to the song, it had to be all one-syllable words. I was stifled, and down in Washington, after my endless pleas, Lenny put in two little quarter notes so that I could put ‘make of our’ as in ‘Make of our hearts one heart.’ Not a great deal, but at least a little better.” Ibid., 23.

36. The piano-vocal manuscript of “One Hand, One Heart” also reveals that some of its orchestral material was sung, and more significantly, that the instrumental foreshadowing of “Somewhere” introducing the song was not a late addition.


38. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 49.

39. Ibid., 49–50.

40. In a letter dated “8 Aug already!” Bernstein writes to his wife, Felicia, that he had written “a new song for Tony” the day before. Burton, Leonard Bernstein, 272.


42. The locale of this scene changed several times. In the first two librettos “Tonio” appears in the opening scene with the Jets. In the two following libretto drafts, the scene takes place at the drugstore fountain; in the librettos of April 14 and May 1 the locale is the corner of a playground. The final draft moves from Tony’s bedroom (June 1) to an unspecified yard in (July 19).

44. Bernstein describes his intentions further in his “8 Aug. already!” letter to Felicia: “It's really going to save his character—a driving 2/4 in the great tradition (but of course fucked up by me with 3/4s and whatnot)—but it gives Tony balls—so that he doesn’t emerge as just a euphoric dreamer.” Burton, Leonard Bernstein, 272.

45. The antecedents of the Romeo and Juliet legend go back at least as far as the Greek myth of Pyramus and Thisbe, who, like their Shakespearean counterparts, are forbidden from marrying by their parents, and who, mistakenly thinking the other dead, needlessly take their own lives. Variations on a related theme frequented Renaissance Italy and were adapted by French and English writers for more than a hundred years before Shakespeare drafted his play. Geoffrey Bullough and Kenneth Muir have surveyed these and other sources of this tale of woe, and it is now unquestioned that Shakespeare borrowed heavily from Arthur Brooke's once popular poem, “The Tragicall Historye of Romeus and Juliet” (1562), itself based on the Italian Le Novelle del Bandello (1554), adapted into French by Pierre Boisteau (1559) and translated into English by William Painter (1567). Muir demonstrates Shakespeare’s fidelity to Brooke’s poem, including unmistakable “verbal echoes,” and notes “three occasions” where “the phrasing of the poem is repeated almost word for word.”

In performing his alchemy Shakespeare condensed the time frame of Brooke’s leisurely romance (3,020 lines) from more than nine months to less than one week. Brooke even allows his Romeus and Juliet a month or two of marital bliss before the fatal duel in which Romeus, in self-defense, kills Tybalt. Muir argues that this striking increase in “speed and intensity . . . shows the passionate impulsiveness of the two lovers, and [that] it makes them consummate their marriage in the knowledge that they must separate on the morrow.”


46. Despite the vocal resources on hand, Berlioz in his “dramatic symphony” (1838–1839) uses the orchestra exclusively to portray the central dramatic events, the Balcony Scene and the Death of Romeo and Juliet. Tchaikovsky’s Fantasy-Overture (1869, revised in 1870 and 1880) contains no vocal parts at all.


48. Most of Zeffirelli’s distortions can be attributed to his predilection to replace Shakespeare’s dialogue with visual images, often with musical accompaniment. Act V exemplifies this approach. In scene 1 he replaces Romeo’s soliloquy (a description of a dream that lasts approximately thirty seconds) with the visual image of Balthasar passing Friar John on the road to Mantua. Gone also from scene 1 is Romeo’s poignant meeting with the Apothecary. Together these deletions reduce Shakespeare’s eighty-five lines to a mere six. Gone entirely is the twenty-nine-line second scene between Friar Laurence and Friar John.

In scene 3 Zeffirelli omits Paris and his duel with Romeo in front of Juliet’s tomb, the dialogue between the watchmen, most of Prince Escalus’s lines, and Friar Laurence’s explanation of the tragic events. Capulet, Lady Capulet, and Montague are seen but not heard. Thus, out of 310 lines Zeffirelli preserves only 160. The time he saves on Shakespeare’s “extraneous” dialogue allows movie audiences to hear additional uninterrupted repetitions of Nino Rota’s “Love Song from Romeo and Juliet.” Ironically, when all is said and sung, the nineteen minutes of Zeffirelli’s act V occupy nearly as much total time as the marginally abbreviated British Broadcasting Corporation version (twenty-two minutes).

49. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 47.
50. Some of the parallels between Shakespeare’s play and its musical adaptation described in the following paragraphs were derived from Norris Houghton, “Romeo and Juliet and West Side Story.”

51. A rare “sugar coating” in the film version occurs when Doc’s drugstore is metamorphosed into a candy store.

52. Isaac Asimov cites numerous textual details to support his assertion that the feud had lost most of its steam before the outset of the play. Asimov’s Guide to Shakespeare (New York: Avenel Books, 1978), vol. 1, 474–98.

53. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 47.

54. West Side Story libretto drafts Nos. 1 and 2, 2–5–9.

55. West Side Story libretto draft No. 3, 2–5–23.

56. Guernsey, ed., Broadway Song & Story, 43.

57. Ibid., 44. Bernstein told Burton in an interview that he “tried giving all the material to the orchestra and having her [Maria] sing an obbligato throughout” and “a version that sounded just like a Puccini aria, which we really did not need.” Even after numerous attempts, he “never got past six bars with it.” Burton, Leonard Bernstein, 275.


59. In a letter to Felicia, dated July 23, 1957, Bernstein writes that “all the aspects of the score I like best—the big, poetic parts—get criticized as ‘operatic’—and there’s a concerted move to chuck them.” Burton, Leonard Bernstein, 271.


61. Ibid., 245.


63. Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 37. For a more extended comparison between the viewpoints of Swain and Banfield see my Review Essay, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 20–27.

64. Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 37.

65. In chapter 2 the notion of a “river family” of motives in Show Boat was considered; a network of motives related to the principal characters of Porgy and Bess was explored in chapter 4.

66. The deceptive chord is usually the submedian or vi chord (e.g., an A minor triad in the key of C). An earlier example of a deceptive cadence to the vi chord occurs in Show Boat’s “Where’s the Mate for Me?,” the first chord on the word “fancy” (see Example 2.5b).

67. See also the discussion of Blitzstein’s meaningfully dramatic treatment of Beethoven’s Egmont Overture in The Cradle Will Rock (chapter 6, pp. 125–28).

68. In the orchestral manuscript that followed shortly, Tony and Maria also sing the four preceding measures reserved for the orchestra in the vocal manuscript and the final version.

69. Bernstein also displaces the second note of “Somewhere” in measures 3, 11, and 27 by raising it an octave.

70. See measures 11, 13, 14–15, 27, 29, 31–32. When they reach the “open air” (m. 6) with “time to spare” (m. 14), the vocal part melodically outlines an E major triad (E-G♯-B), although Bernstein contradicts this latter tonic resolution with opposing harmony. The harmony that supports “time to spare” once again suggests C♯ minor (C♯-E-G♯). Bernstein further dilutes the impact of his first major triads associated with his second motive by immediately following each of its statements with a minor triad in the vocal line.

71. Shakespeare, much like a Greek tragedian, wanted his audiences to know in advance the fate of his “star-crossed lovers.” In the event that they were unfamiliar with this popular and often-told tale, he provided a précis of the plot in the Prologue to act I told by a Chorus.
The Chorus can be a chorus of one, for example, John Gielgud in two filmed versions (Verona 1954 and BBC 1978).

72. The scene that contains “Tonight” is designated the Balcony Scene in the published vocal score (New York: G. Schirmer and Chappell, 1957 and 1959).

73. In his introductory survey of music, Joseph Kerman concludes his discussion of West Side Story by pointing out that “Bernstein’s fugue recalls the famous ‘Great Fugue’ by Ludwig van Beethoven” [the original final movement of the B♭ Major String Quartet, op. 130]. Joseph Kerman, Listen, 2d brief ed. (New York: Worth, 1992), 393. According to Banfield, “the ‘Cool’ twelve-note fugue seems as indebted to Beethoven’s Grosse Fuge as does ‘Somewhere’s melodic contour to his ‘Emperor’ Concerto and its sparse counterpoint to his late quartet.” Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 37.

74. In particular, the abrupt and explosive sforzando accent on the concluding third note of the first motive (a) and the strong accents on the first note of the third motive (c1 and c3) within a jazzy context depict a convincing premonition of the inevitable outcome facing the Jets and Sharks as well as Tony and Maria.

The remaining appearances of the first or “There’s a place” motive from “Somewhere” (a) maintains its primary association with the principal lovers. For example, the orchestral introduction to “One Hand, One Heart”—which also incorporates additional melodic liberties in its statement of the “place for us” motive (b)—again prepares the future fate of Tony and Maria and in the process links a song to West Side Story that had been withdrawn from Candide the previous year. The upwardly striving “There’s a place” motive acts as a musical symbol for a better place in another life for Tony and Maria. In a dramatically effective reprise, at the end of the “Nightmare,” the elided first and second “Somewhere” motives (“There’s a place” and “place for us”) return to the orchestra and Bernstein uses the second motive to support Tony’s singing of “half-way there” and “take you there.”

75. Like the “There’s a place” motive, the third “Somewhere” motive (Example 13.4c) appears ubiquitously in the “Cool” fugue. It is most conspicuous, however, in earlier portions of the Dream Sequence where an ascending half step—again as in Maria’s name—appears in the orchestral underpinning of Under Dialogue (13) and Ballet Sequence (13a). The third “Somewhere” motive will again figure prominently in the “Finale” (17) directly after Tony’s death as an inner melodic strand throughout the procession and in the three final statements that parallel the finale of the Dream Ballet as the last notes we hear. It also appears conspicuously but with less apparent dramatic justification throughout much of “America” (7).

76. Larry Stempel notes that the music of “I Have a Love” is a transformed version of Anita’s music in the preceding “A Boy Like That,” for example, on the words, “A boy who kills cannot love, / A boy who kills has no heart.” Stempel, “Broadway’s Mozartean Moment,” 50.

77. Among West Side Story chroniclers, only Banfield notes a possible Wagnerian reference when he writes that “one even senses a hint of Tristan in Tony’s supplication for ‘endless night.’” Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 34. Peyser, in noting the influence of Wagner in Bernstein’s final opera, A Quiet Place (1983), concludes that Wagner was “an influence that had been nowhere apparent in Bernstein up to the late 1970s.” Peyser, Leonard Bernstein, 457.

television lectures of the 1950s. Gradenwitz, a German musicologist who remained a personal friend of the composer, also wrote notes for Bernstein recordings. For studies that appeared since the first edition of *Enchanted Evenings* see Gottlieb, *Funny, It Doesn’t Sound Jewish* on Bernstein’s use of the Shofar call (179–80) and Raymond Knapp, *The American Musical and the Formation of National Identity* for the plausible observation that the Maria or love transformation of the hate motive may be derived from the opening of the love theme from Tchaikovsky’s Overture to *Romeo and Juliet* (212).

79. In the underrated *Wonderful Town* (1953), perfect fifths also figure prominently in abbreviated thematic reminiscences that contribute to an “organic” musical unity, although these musical connections do not reinforce dramatic nuances as they will in *West Side Story*. Several melodies that emphasize perfect fifths reappear in other songs as well: the main tune of “A Little Bit in Love” serves as an introduction to “It’s Love” and the main tune of “It’s Love” forms the introduction to “A Quiet Girl.” A second type of connection is thematic reminiscence, as, for example, when the first measure of “Pass That Football”—most of the tune is musically and dramatically identical to “What a Waste”—returns in the first two measures of “A Quiet Girl.” A third unifying element derives from the reuse of the dotted boogie-woogie accompaniments originally associated with the sisters Ruth and Eileen in “Ohio,” Ruth in “One Hundred Easy Ways,” and Eileen in “A Little Bit in Love,” and distorted in R Dink’s “Pass That Football,” Ruth’s “Swing!,” and the sisters’ “Wrong Note Rag.”

80. The instrumental “Paris Waltz Scene” and its rhythmic transformation in the finale “Make Our Garden Grow” of *Candide* bears a strong resolution to the first “Somewhere” motive. In both, the upward leap of a minor seventh is followed by descending half step (minor second). In the *Candide* finale, as in “Somewhere,” Bernstein starts in E major and modulates to C (although *Candide* parts company with “Somewhere” with its intervening modulation to A♭ major and in its avoidance of a return to E). The overlapping compositional histories of *Candide* and *West Side Story* produced additional musical affinities that go beyond the exchanges among their songs discussed earlier in this chapter.


82. Bernstein’s manuscript for the Prelogue opens with the “hate” motive (A♭–D♭–G), bracketed and labeled “optional curtain music.” The Broadway cast album retains this introduction, and in the film version, the “hate” motive is used effectively at the outset and at other strategic moments as the Jet’s warning whistle. The “hate” motive also appears unaltered in the “Cool” fugue where it joins the first and third “Somewhere” motives.

83. In the album jacket notes of the soundtrack, Hollis Alpert makes the following point: “With the intermissions between acts eliminated, one rising line of tension, from beginning to end, was required. The neatest solution, resulting in almost no change in the text, was the juxtaposition of musical numbers” (Columbia OS 2070). Thus, in dramatic contrast to most movie versions of hit Broadway shows, the makers of the *West Side Story* film made a valiant attempt to retain all of the music and to preserve the dramatic integrity, if not the ordering, of the Broadway original. Ironically, when *West Side Story* was first released, theaters, deprived of a B-movie second feature due to the length of the main event, thwarted the intentions of the film’s creators by inserting an intermission as a concession to the concessionaires. Following the numbers in the vocal score and the online website, the order in the film version is as follows: Nos. 1–5, 7–6, 14, 12, 9–11, 13, 8, and 15–17.

84. The final measures of Bernstein’s musical bears a striking—and identically pitched—resemblance to the apotheosis of the central character on the final notes of Stravinsky’s *Petrushka* (1911).
85. The CD reissued in 1992 restores the Broadway ending in the previously unreleased “Finale” (Sony SK 48211).
86. In the reissued CD, the previously released End Credits restored the three tritones that accompanied the film.

Chapter 14: Stage vs. Screen (2) After Oklahoma!

1. Among her many roles Moreno played the waitress in “It’s an Art” from the 1982 American Playhouse broadcast of Working in 1982 and dubbed the voice of Carmen Sandiego in the television series Where in the World Is Carmen Sandiego?
2. Gerald Mast, Can’t Help Singin’, 217 and 216.
4. Bruce Babington and Peter William Evans, Blue Skies and Silver Linings, 187–204 (quotations on 197 and 204).
5. One interesting addition is when Billy’s responds to Mrs. Mullin’s accusation that his attentions to Julie have spoiled the good name of her carousel by accusing Mrs. Mullin herself of giving the enterprise a bad name the day she acquired it. For ’50s audiences who may not know what a chippie is, the word is replaced by its modern equivalent, slut.
6. See chapter 9 for a discussion of the Julie and Carrie Sequence and the Bench Scene.
7. Like many recordings of popular songs of the era, the “June” chorus is heard before its verse.
10. Porter himself did to Shakespeare what new lyric writers frequently did to Porter throughout the film when he changed Shakespeare’s “Then vail your stomachs, for it is no boot / And place your hands below your husband’s foot” to “So wife, hold your temper and meekly put / Your hand ‘neath the sole of your husband’s foot” in Porter.
11. A. Scott Berg, Goldwyn, 470.
12. Ibid., 470.
13. Even before the age of twenty Simmons gained exposure in the role of Estella in Great Expectations (1946) and Ophelia in Laurence Olivier’s Hamlet (1948). In the years before Guys and Dolls she had leading roles in Androcles and the Lion and The Robe in 1953 and played opposite Brando’s Napoleon in Destree in 1954. After Guys and Dolls, her major film role was probably that of Sister Falconer in Elmer Gantry (1960).
15. Ibid., 525.
16. In the years between the stage and film versions of My Fair Lady, Beaton had designed the costumes and sets for Lerner and Loewe’s Academy Award–winning film Gigi (1958).
18. Cast aside as the film Eliza, Andrews accepted the consolation prize role of Mary Poppins and earned eternal vindication when she took home the Best Actress Oscar and Hepburn was not even nominated. The next year Andrews starred in the popular and acclaimed film musical, The Sound of Music.
20. Ibid.
Notes to Pages 327–341


22. With the exception of the winning costume designer and the quartet of orchestrators, most of the hardworking craftspeople honored are unknown other than to insiders in the field. This footnote will honor their substantial contributions to this technically brilliant film: Art Direction (Victor A. Gangelin); Cinematography (Daniel L. Fapp); Costumes (Irene Sharaff); Film Editing (Thomas Stanford); Scoring (Saul Chaplin, Johnny Green, Sid Ramin, and Irwin Kostal); and Sound Mixing (Gordon E. Sawyer and Fred Hynes).

23. See for example, Sondheim, “Theater Lyrics,” 84–85.


25. The AFI also placed West Side Story as No. 41 on its “Top 100 American Movies of the Last 100 Years,” compiled in 1998. The only musicals ahead of West Side Story on the list were The Wizard of Oz at No. 6 and Singin’ in the Rain at No. 10. The other seven film musicals on the AFI list, which include two animated features and a biopic, were Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs (49), The Sound of Music (55), Fantasia (58), An American in Paris (68), The Jazz Singer (90), My Fair Lady (91), and Yankee Doodle Dandy (100).

Chapter 15: Sweeney Todd and Sunday in the Park with George

1. After Merman’s departure, Gypsy received several acclaimed revivals and films that highlighted a staggering array of luminous stars, including Rosalind Russell (Warner Bros. Film, 1962), Angela Lansbury (West End and Broadway, 1973 and 1974), Tyne Daly (Broadway, 1989), Bette Midler (Television movie, 1993), Betty Buckley (Paper Mill Playhouse in Millburn, N.J., 1998), Bernadette Peters (Broadway, 2003), and Patti Lupone (Ravinia Festival, Chicago, 2006; Encores! City Center, N.Y., 2007; Broadway, 2008).

2. For an extended discussion of the difficult collaboration and a more positive appraisal of Waltz, see Geoffrey Block, Richard Rodgers, 213–25.


7. Ibid., 4.

8. Ibid., 15.

9. Ibid.

10. Ibid., 19.

11. Ibid., 21.

12. Ibid., 22.

13. Ibid., 23.

14. Ibid., 34.

15. Although work on By George was begun in the spring of 1945, the show remained largely dormant until the following spring (around the time of Sondheim’s sixteenth birthday on March 22). It is possible that Hammerstein’s famous shredding of Sondheim’s work occurred later than usually reported. In any event, By George was first performed in May 1946.

17. Hammerstein, “Notes on Lyrics,” 45–46; Sondheim, “Theater Lyrics,” 65–66. Hammerstein’s point is well taken, but if he had been a Civil War buff he might have known that hot air balloons developed by France in the eighteenth century made it possible to use this technology for reconnaissance several decades before the French gave the United States its beloved statue.

18. From the third show, Mary Poppins, based on the stories by P. L. Travers, Sondheim discovered the difficulties of libretto writing (Hammerstein customarily wrote the librettos as well as the lyrics). In “Theater Lyrics” Sondheim recalls that he sent Hammerstein a script for the fourth, original musical that included a ninety-nine-page first act and that Hammerstein circled this impressive number and wrote “Wow” (“Theater Lyrics,” 63).

19. The title Phinney’s Rainbow incorporated allusions to Finian’s Rainbow, a popular musical of 1947 with lyrics by E. Y. Harburg and music by Burton Lane and to the president of Williams at the time, James Phinney Baxter.

20. Steven Suskin lists three stagings of Saturday Night: a reading by the Bridewell Theater Company in 1995; a small production, also in London, in 1997; and a production by the Pegasus Players in Chicago in 1999 with two new songs (Suskin, Show Tunes, 274–75). The show received its New York premiere on February 17, 2000. A cast recording was released that same year on Nonesuch 79609–2.


22. Ibid., 70.

23. Ibid., 70–71.

24. Ibid., 71.


26. Babbitt’s encyclopedic knowledge of popular music of the 1920s and 1930s and his aborted aspirations to composing popular music in the 1940s are less widely known. For those familiar with the breadth of his interests it is not surprising that in addition to teaching the European classics, Babbitt would also analyze the popular songs of DeSylva, Brown, and Henderson, Kern, Rodgers, and Gershwin “with exactly the same serious tone.” See Eugene R. Hubert, ed., “A Conversation with Stephen Sondheim” (typescript), quoted in Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 22.


28. Sondheim remarked in an interview that “Moss Hart did a concept musical. His Thousands Cheer was a concept musical in 1933. Concept musicals have existed forever.” Quoted in Ilson, 195. For an application of the “ideal type” to the Broadway musical, see Block, “The Broadway Canon,” 537–39 and note 15.

29. See Foster Hirsch, Harold Prince, and Carol Ilson, Harold Prince.

30. The use of the concept musical on behalf of the integrated ideal is analogous to the practice of classical modernists (for example, Schoenberg and later Sondheim’s teacher Babbitt), who offered increasingly complex exhibitions of motivic unity to generate new heights in organicism.

31. Prince, Contradictions, 231. Ethan Mordden’s take on whether Follies should be considered a failure is worth quoting: “Obviously, in days of lower costs, a hit made money and a flop lost money. But by 1971, hits lost money. No show that wins Follies’ awards and runs over a year and eventually gets four major recordings, all the while becoming a classic by any standard of measurement, can be called a failure” (Mordden, One More Kiss, 40). Twenty years later, Lloyd Webber’s Sunset Boulevard, another relatively long-running, award-winning hit, managed to lose $25 million.
32. In his informative Everything Was Possible, Ted Chapin includes the Newsweek design that featured Follies on the cover. The caption reads: “Both Time and Newsweek were planning to do cover stories of the show. However, they never liked to run the same ‘soft’-news covers, so when Time went forward with theirs, Newsweek canceled, but not before this cover was designed” (Chapin, second page of photo inserts between 144 and 145).

33. Considering the alleged absence of song hits, one cannot help but be struck by the frequency and popularity of revues and other retrospectives based on Sondheim songs, especially Side by Side by Sondheim (1976) and Putting It Together (1993).

34. Sondheim (with Prince), “Author and Director” (published in 1985), 357.
36. Ibid., 6.
37. Ibid.
38. Ibid.
39. Ibid., 10.
40. Ibid., 11.
41. Mark Horowitz, Sondheim on Music, 155.
42. Ibid., 155.
43. Banfield, Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals, 290.
44. Ibid., 291.
47. Craig Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 246.
48. Sondheim, “The Art of the Musical,” 274. Banfield points out that the chord Sondheim labeled as his “Sweeney chord” (a minor seventh with the seventh in the bass, C-D-F-A) and which appears only rarely in the score—for example, the last chord of the Judge’s version of “Johanna”—is in any event not the same as the Hanover Square chord (a diminished triad with an added major seventh, spelled as a diminished octave, G♯-B-D-G) (Banfield, 305–7).
51. In Sondheim’s “defense,” the version of the organ Prelude heard on the cast album alludes to but does not quote the Dies irae.
53. In Laurents’s revised version of Do I Hear a Waltz? performed at the George Street Playhouse in New Jersey in 2000 and the Pasadena Playhouse in 2001 (Fynsworth Alley CD 302 062 156 2), the reprise of “Take the Moment” was deleted and replaced by “Everybody Loves Leona,” which had been discarded from the original production.
55. “City on Fire!” is first heard at the beginning of No. 26 and repeated after a short reprise of “Kiss Me.” It returns in No. 27, after the Searching music “Not While I’m Around” and again after the Beggar Woman’s “Alms….alms.”
56. The eight songs that are not reprised in the final sequence are “The Worst Pies in London,” “Green Finch and Linnet Bird,” “Johanna” (Anthony’s version), “Pirelli’s Miracle Elixir,” “Wait,” and “Ladies in Their Sensitivities” from act I and “God, That’s Good!” and “Parlor Songs” from act II.
57. Horowitz, Sondheim on Music, 143.
58. Ibid., 144.


61. The soundtrack includes the music and lyrics attached to the Beggar Woman’s coarse sexual solicitations that follow her plaintive solicitations for money, which Anthony gives her before he asks about the residents of the house.


65. Another excellent example of this approach occurs in the film version of “A Glamorous Life,” in which Frederika sings about her mother; it is accompanied by images of her mother, Desiree, played by Elizabeth Taylor, who does not sing in this number.


68. The motive of “Putting It Together” (Ex. 15.3a) adds one additional long note to the horn call. Although neither of the two new long notes of the former are as long as the single long note in the horn call, the connection between these motives might be discernible even to those who disdain the idea of organic connections.


74. The two librettos of The Girls Upstairs (from among the alleged thirteen) housed in the Theater Collection of the New York Public Library (Restricted Material #5870 [first draft] and Restricted material #2624 [second draft]) for the most part substantiate Prince’s recollection. Seven of the twenty-two numbers in the 1971 Follies (in addition to the “Prologue”) can be traced to these pre-Follies versions; four of these songs appear in Restricted Material #5870. The New York Public Library also houses two drafts of Follies, one dated September 1970 (Restricted Material #2625) and the other January 2, 1971 (NCOF+73–1867).

75. Ilson, Harold Prince, 180.

76. Many, if not all, of the discarded Follies songs have been recorded on Follies: The Complete Recording (1998) (CD: TVT 1020–2) 2-disc set and A Collector’s Sondheim (1985) (CD: RCD3–5480) 3-disc set.


78. The resolution of a triadic figure to the fifth of its triad offers a striking parallel (if not influence) in the culminating transformation of the principal motive in the first movement of Beethoven’s Symphony No. 3 (the “Eroica”), first heard toward the end of the development and increasingly prominent in the recapitulation and coda. See the commentary by J. Peter Burkholder in Norton Anthology of Western Music. Volume 2: Classic to Twentieth Century, 5th ed., ed. by Burkholder and Claude V. Palisca (New York: W. W. Norton), 281–82.


81. Prince, Contradictions, 163.

82. In honor of Bernstein’s seventieth birthday, Sondheim composed the parody “The Saga of Lenny,” which, according to a particularly helpful anonymous reader of this book (later revealed as Wayne Shirley), “shows a good understanding and sympathy with the original “Saga of Jenny.”” See also Steve Swayne, How Sondheim Found His Sound, 272n110.

83. Prior to Follies, Simon had written the books for Little Me (1962), Sweet Charity (1966), and Promises, Promises (1968) (the latter choreographed by Bennett). After Follies, Simon would contribute uncredited one-liners in Bennett’s Seesaw (1973) and A Chorus Line (e.g., Sheila’s “Sometimes I’m aggressive”), and the libretto for the adaptation for his The Goodbye Girl, like Chorus Line with music by Marvin Hamlisch. Bennett also played an important role in Simon’s work. He assisted (without credit) the direction of The Good Doctor (1973) and directed God’s Favorite (1974). See Mandelbaum, “‘A Chorus Line,’” 74, 78, 85–86, 124, 146–47.

84. Ibid., 74.

85. Zadan, Sondheim & Co., 150.

86. Ibid., 148, 150.

87. Ibid. Although he acknowledged that “many critics felt that Goldman’s book was the weak link in Follies, and that it contained unpleasant characters difficult to care about and action that was hard to follow,” Sondheim concluded that “these critics were only echoing Bennett’s sentiments throughout the tryout” (Mandelbaum, “‘A Chorus Line,’” 73–74). For a thoughtful defense of the book, see Mordden, One More Kiss, 34–47.


89. Ibid., 151–52.

90. Ilson also notes that “ironically, when the show was revived in London in 1987, Goldman has them [Ben and Phyllis] stay together” (Ilson, Harold Prince, 196).
91. A folly song (in *Follies*) is a song in which each of the principals sings an honest diegetic “number” that reveals their deeper nature and conflicts. All the follies take place in the imaginary Loveland in the last part of the musical. After “The Folly of Love” (an ensemble number) and “The Folly of Youth” (separate and then combined duets by the principal married couples), Buddy, Sally, Phyllis, and Ben sing their solo follies in succession.

92. The first movement of Grieg’s concerto had also been featured prominently in *Song of Norway* (loosely based on the life of Grieg) and more briefly in the song “Rosemary” from Loesser’s *How to Succeed in Business without Really Trying*.

93. When I asked to study a copy of the 1987 *Follies* libretto, Goldman “turned the matter over to his attorney” and “notified the Library of Congress that no permission is to be given for an examination copy” (letter to the author from Barbara Deren, President, Barbara Deren Associates, July 5, 1994). From this letter I have inferred that the librettist came to favor the 1971 libretto, but I could be mistaken.


95. The lyrics to all four songs, “Marry Me a Little,” “Multitudes of Amys,” “Happily Ever After,” and “Being Alive,” are printed and discussed in Sondheim, “Theater Lyrics,” 92–97. See also Banfield, 166–73.


97. Ibid., 183.


99. Gottfried, *Sondheim*, 151. Banfield considers the critical problems generated by *Merrily’s* autobiographical subject matter: “But it would be difficult to fix the audience’s sympathy—and regrets—on Franklin Shepard, for the simple reason that the musical is about the compromise of his talent and we can only measure that talent by transferring it to Sondheim” (Banfield, *Sondheim’s Broadway Musicals*, 312).

100. Banfield would call this technique “reflexivity,” that is, “the words describing what the music is doing.” Ibid., 42.

101. The populist Sondheim composed two songs for Madonna to sing in the movie *Dick Tracy* (1990), including the Academy Award–winning Best Song of 1991, “Sooner or Later.” Sondheim gained major recognition with the popular and critically acclaimed 2007 film release of *Sweeney Todd* featuring box-office sensation Johnny Depp discussed earlier in this chapter.


**Chapter 16: The Phantom of the Opera**


2. Of these shows only *Aspects of Love* (closed too soon) and *Sunset Boulevard* (too expensive) lost money in their New York runs. It should be noted that Lloyd Webber musicals almost invariably enjoyed longer, usually far longer London runs. Here are the comparisons:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Musical</th>
<th>New York performances</th>
<th>London performances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joseph</td>
<td>747</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jesus Christ Superstar</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>3,358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evita</td>
<td>1,568</td>
<td>2,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cats</td>
<td>7,485</td>
<td>8,949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Starlight Express</td>
<td>761</td>
<td>7,406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phantom</td>
<td>8,771 (as of 2/2/09)</td>
<td>9,568 (as of 10/9/08)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Aspects of Love  New York, 377 performances; London, 1,325
Sunset Boulevard  New York, 977 performances; Los Angeles, 369; London, 1,529

Despite the apparent reversal of the norm in the case of Joseph, according to Michael Patrick Kennedy and John Muir in Musicals, “the 1980 production became a provincial phenomenon in Britain, setting up a record as the longest-lived touring show of the postwar era, and making periodic appearances in London en route” (Michael Patrick Kennedy and John Muir, Musicals, 187). As of this writing, after Les Misérables (Boublil and Schönberg), the second, third, and fifth longest running shows in the West End (Phantom, Cats, and Starlight Express, respectively) are Lloyd Webber shows.  Jesus Christ Superstar ran for eight years,  Evita nearly seven.  Evita was also the longest running foreign musical import up to that time, to be eventually surpassed by Cats.

4. Jesus Christ Superstar was the only Lloyd Webber-nominated show before Evita was nominated for the 1972 Best Score Tony Award (awarded to Sondheim’s Follies); by the time Evita won for Best Musical and Best Score in 1980, Sondheim had already obtained this prize for four shows (Company, Follies, Night Music, and Sweeney Todd).
5. Rent (5,124 performances) lost its bid to overtake Cats when it closed on September 7, 2008.
6. John Snelson, Andrew Lloyd Webber, 2. Everett notes that during the 2000–01 season West End audiences could see as many as five Lloyd Webber shows (Prece and Everett, “The Megamusical,” 254).
7. Michael Walsh, Andrew Lloyd Webber.
10. Ibid., 378.
12. Scott Miller, From “Assassins” to “West Side Story” (Assassins, Company, Into the Woods, Jesus Christ Superstar, Merrily We Roll Along, and Sweeney Todd); Deconstructing Harold Hill (Passion, Sunday in the Park with George); and Rebels with Applause (Anyone Can Whistle).
13. Jessica Sternfeld, The Megamusical. In her “Introduction,” 1–7, Sternfeld presents a useful definition and description of the megamusical. The chapters that follow constitute the most thorough study of the subgenre to date.
14. See, for example, Mark Grant, The Rise and Fall of the Broadway Musical; John Bush Jones, Our Musicals, Ourselves; and Scott McMillin, The Musical Drama.
15. Stephen Citron, Sondheim & Lloyd-Webber. I think it is not inappropriate to mention that some on the Advisory Board seriously questioned whether Lloyd Webber merited inclusion in a series called Yale Broadway Masters.
16. Quoted from Mattheson’s Der Vollkommene Capellmeister (1739) in J. Peter Burkholder, “Borrowing.” In Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online, www.oxfordmusiconline.com/ subscriber/article/grove/music/62918pg15 (accessed September 24, 2008). The quote continues: “One must so construct and develop imitations that they are prettier and better than the pieces from which they are derived.”
17. Romberg’s Blossom Time (1921), a huge hit in its day and in many touring productions for decades thereafter, consisted of Romberg’s reworking of recognizable Schubert melodies.
Romberg’s reported quip, “Not yet,” at a party in response to whether he had composed Offenbach’s familiar Barcarolle from Les Contes d’Hoffmann which was playing in the background, humorously acknowledges this reputation for musical borrowing.

18. Snelson, Andrew Lloyd Webber, 172.

19. Ibid., 167. Louiguy’s given name was Louis Guglielmi. In 1955 a cha-cha arrangement of ‘Cherry Pink’ by ‘Mambo King’ Pérez Prado was number one on American hit charts for ten consecutive weeks. After ‘Cherry Pink,’ Louiguy’s other mega song hit was ‘La vie en rose,’ composed for French chanteuse Edith Piaf.

20. Ibid., 168.

21. Walsh describes Lloyd Webber’s descending chords as “the spiritual heirs of the first notes” of Vaughan Williams’s symphony while Grant more directly states that the “opening minor-key descending riff in the title tune of Phantom of the Opera is stolen from Vaughan Williams’s London Symphony” (Walsh, Andrew Lloyd Webber, 33; Grant, The Rise and Fall of the Broadway Musical, 33).

22. Citron includes a comparative musical example of “Music of the Night” and “School Days” and Snelson includes the relevant passage of “Recondite armonia” (Citron, Sondheim & Lloyd-Webber, 334–35, and Snelson, Andrew Lloyd Webber, 179).

23. Example 16.2 shows the relevant phrase only in La fanciulla. For an example that includes other “motivic connections” between both La fanciulla and its borrowing in Phantom, see Snelson, Andrew Lloyd Webber, 179.


25. Sternfeld, 87. Sternfeld does address the disparity between people who love and people hate the musicals of Lloyd Webber, and recognizes parallels in reception between the composer of Phantom and the composer of Turandot but reaches different conclusions from those presented here: “It is rare for critics and audiences to disagree so strongly about a composer; interestingly, another of these rare instances concerns reactions to the operas of Giacomo Puccini, whose style Lloyd Webber has admired and occasionally emulated. In fact, critics often complain that Lloyd Webber sounds too much like Puccini, even when the music does not support this, as if they are considering instead reputation and their own role as critics deriding a popular composer” (Ibid., 72).

26. Space prohibits rigorous identification of Lloyd Webber’s borrowings, but I think it is important to note the subtle melodic and harmonic allusions to the finale of Rachmaninoff’s Second Piano Concerto in the very first sounds audiences hear in Sunset Boulevard (which return as the main musical material in the refrain of Max von Mayerling’s homage to the great silent film star Norma Desmond he serves and loves, “The Greatest Star of All”). This is an inspired allusion. Unfortunately, this degree of originality is rare in Phantom and other Lloyd Webber shows.

27. Block, “Integration.”


29. Ibid., 165.


31. Ibid., 325.


34. Foster Hirsch, Hal Prince, 169.

36. John Snelson illustrates the whole-tone scale in the “I have brought you” verse (which he labels “Phantom’s Lair theme” [Ex. 4.6]) and reveals how this scale pervades an earlier passage in the coda of “Angel of Music” between Christine and Meg (Ex. 4.5), where Christine explains that “He’s with me even now” (Snelson, *Andrew Lloyd Webber*, 94–95).

37. From the Sondheim interview in the “Musical Mayhem” special feature in the DVD in which he asserted that the *Sweeney* film was “an attempt to take the material of the stage musical and completely transform it” and “not a movie of a stage show” (Sondheim, “Interview with Sondheim,” 2007).

38. The film abandons some dialogue and recitative, the reprise of “Notes” in act II, and most lamentably the rehearsal of *Don Juan Triumphant*, also in act II. Conversely, the film adds numerous underscored scenic visual moments and pantomimed action devoid of either singing or talking. An example of the latter is an intense and prolonged swordfight at the cemetery in which Raoul emerges victorious over the Phantom but spares his life at Christine’s urging. Viewers also watch at some length as Raoul tries to overcome physical obstacles to reach Christine in the Phantom’s lair at the climax of the story.

39. The returns to the 1919 frame are part of a larger attempt to make some of the more mysterious plot elements clear to a film audience who may not have seen the stage version many times. For example, the film adds a short conversation between Christine and Meg before they sing “Angel of Music,” including flashbacks of Meg’s mother bringing Christine to the opera house after her famous violinist father died and promised that an Angel of Music would appear to guide her. The conversation also lessens Christine’s gullibility and clarifies her emotional connection to the disembodied teacher sent by the spirit of her beloved father.

40. In an interesting touch, the singer over the credits is Minnie Driver, who plays the temperamental Italian prima donna Carlotta Giudicelli, whose voice in the film is dubbed by an operatic professional Margaret Preece.

41. Sternfeld calls this motive the “story motif” due to its usual association with various kinds of narration or exposition, but in his own program listing of musical material Lloyd Webber offers the title “I Remember” for act I, scene 6 (Sternfeld, *The Megamusical*, 247–50 and 385).

42. *Enchanted Evenings*, 1st ed., 191–93,

43. Ibid., 375n29.

44. This is the theme Sternfeld labeled “the story motif” (Sternfeld, *The Megamusical*, 245–46).

45. See Example 5.7 in Sternfeld for the simple rhythmic variation on the “I have brought you” motive in the “Little Lotte” music (Ibid., 251–52).

46. In “The Making of *The Phantom of the Opera,*” the documentary that accompanies the DVD release of the 2004 *Phantom* film, viewers learn that Lloyd Webber wanted “All I Ask of You” to capture the quality of “Some Enchanted Evening” from *South Pacific*, a musical long regarded as one of his earliest and most lasting favorites. While the pitches and harmonic underpinning are distinct, the rhythm that opens “All I Ask of You” does bear an intriguing resemblance to the opening rhythm of its Rodgers and Hammerstein predecessor. Snelson includes a musical example of a connection between the second major phrase of “All I Ask of You” and a phrase sung by Minnie, also in *La fanciulla del West* (Snelson, *Andrew Lloyd Webber*, 180). Grant, who offers Jerome Moross as “the least credited source from whom Andrew Lloyd Webber steals tunes” states that “All I Ask of You” from *Phantom of the Opera* is arguably a direct steal from Moross’s great 1958 film score, *The Big Country* (Grant, *The Rise and Fall*, 107).
48. Ibid., 98.
49. See Snelson’s thoughtful accompanying discussion of the melody he labels “Twisted” (Example 4.3) and its meaning (Ibid., 91–92 and 231n8).
50. Since the cast recording omits the intervening dialogue, listeners hear Christine’s rendition less perceptibly meld into Carolotta’s, and the contrast in performance styles is far less extreme.
52. Ibid.
53. Even Lloyd Webber’s financial losses are more colossal than those of Sondheim. Compared to $25 million, the $665,000 that *Follies* lost seems puny in comparison, even when considering rising costs in the twenty-three years that separated the openings of *Follies* and *Sunset Boulevard*.
56. Sternfeld, *The Megamusical*, 75. For what it’s worth, the reason Lloyd Webber named his gelding Frank Rich is not because Rich’s reviews in the *New York Times* were among these raves.